DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 404 403 UD 031 510

AUTHOR Cheng, Maisy
TITLE Anti-Racist Education Project: A Summary Report on the Extent of Implementation and Changes Found in Wards 11/12 Schools: 1991-92 to 1994-95. No. 223.
INSTITUTION Toronto Board of Education, Ontario (Canada). Research and Assessment Dept.
REPORT NO ISBN-0-88881-248-5; ISSN-0316-8786
PUB DATE 96
NOTE 74p.
PUB TYPE Books (010) -- Reports - Evaluative/Feasibility (142)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC03 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS *Board of Education Policy; *Cultural Awareness; Educational Policy; Elementary Education; *Elementary School Students; Ethnic Groups; Foreign Countries; Minority Groups; Multicultural Education; *Parent Attitudes; Racial Bias; *Racial Discrimination; Student Attitudes; Teacher Attitudes; *Urban Schools
IDENTIFIERS Ontario; *Toronto Public Schools ON

ABSTRACT

This report documents how a family of elementary schools in Wards 11 and 12 of the Toronto Board of Education (Ontario, Canada) have carried out their plans for the antiracist education (ARE) mandated by the school board between 1991-92 and 1994-95. Results, based on a variety of data collection methods, reveal areas of accomplishment and challenges still to be met. Among other sources of data were surveys of: (1) 213 parents of students in grades 3 through 8 in 1994-95; (2) 155 teachers in 1992-92 and 71 in 1994-95; (3) 625 students in grades 3 through 8 in 1994-95; and (4) 1,169 elementary school students in 1991-92. Findings indicate that teachers have succeeded in validating the racial and ethnic backgrounds of the students and that curriculum materials have become more reflective of the student population. Racial incidents reported by principals and students have declined during the study period. In addition, teachers have become more willing to acknowledge that racism exists and to take action to deal with racial issues. More work remains to be done, however. Racial minority parents are not fully satisfied with curriculum materials and think that teacher treatment of minority students and parent participation could be improved. An appendix discusses data collection methods. (Contains 6 tables and 22 references.) (SLD)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED 404 403

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

X This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Maisy Cheung
Toronto Board of Ed.

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

ISSN 0316-8786
ISBN 0-88881-248-5

Anti-Racist Education Project:

A summary report on the extent of implementation and changes found in Wards 11/12 Schools: 1991-92 to 1994-95

Fall, 1996

by
Maisy Cheng

Acknowledgments

The contributions of the following persons are deeply appreciated by the author:

* Avi Soudack who assisted in designing the research instruments, co-ordinated and participated in the data collection during the first year of the study, and prepared some of the early interim reports;

* Lisa Rosolen who co-ordinated the data collection, input and analysis activities in the second and fourth years of the study, and reviewed this report;

* Maria Yau who gave many suggestions throughout the various stages of the project and reviewed a draft of this report;

* Suzanne Ziegler who provided input in the design of the study;

* Sylvia Larter who critiqued and edited an earlier version of this report;

* Robert Brown who reviewed a draft of this report;

* Claudette Brown who prepared the charts and tables for the project and transcribed some of the interview tapes;

* Irene Pereira who transcribed most of the interview tapes;

* The Wards 11/12 principals and vice-principals who facilitated and participated in the data collection;

* The Wards 11/12 teachers, students, and parents who took part in the data collection;

* The Research Subcommittee members of the Wards 11/12 Steering Committee on Antiracist Education who provided input in the research methodology of the study;

* Joanne Doauros, the School Community Advisor for Wards 11/12, who helped to arrange for the parent interviews;

* Leon Thompson, the former School Superintendent of Wards 11/12, who provided insights, continuous support and understanding throughout the project.

Executive Summary

This report documents how a family of elementary schools in Wards 11/12 of the Toronto Board of Education have carried out their plans for Anti-Racist Education (ARE) between the 1991/1992 and 1994/1995 school years and examines what kind of progress was made. The results, based on a variety of data collection methods, reveal areas of accomplishment and challenges still to be met.

Areas of accomplishment

- *Curriculum content*

  Teachers have succeeded in validating the racial-ethnic backgrounds of students, increasing their knowledge, awareness and respect for other cultures, and helping them to recognize various forms of social inequalities and to develop assertive skills in challenging discrimination.

- *Curriculum materials*

  Curriculum materials, library books, display materials, supplies and toys have become more reflective of the student population. Such materials have become more available with greater variety and better quality.

- *Student level of interest in reading*

  The level of interest of racial/ethnic minority students in reading has increased along with the increase in the amount of reading materials that validate their cultural identities.

- *School awards*

  Black students who have been underrepresented among the recipients of academic and music/arts awards have increased their representation in these areas within four years.

- *Special Education program placement*

  Staff's increased sensitivity to the equity issues in assessment and placement practices has resulted in the rising enrolment of students who were previously underrepresented in the gifted programs (e.g., Black male students).

- *School climate*

  Racial incidents reported by principals and students have declined during the study period. There was also evidence of friendship and positive interactions among students of diverse racial cultural backgrounds.

- *Staff attitudes towards racism*

  Increasingly, teachers have changed from the denial of racism to acknowledging that it exists, and from heightened awareness to taking action. They have become more comfortable talking about and dealing with racial issues and other forms of injustice.

In addition, ethnic minority teachers felt their cultural identities were affirmed as a result of ARE.

- *Staff treatment of students*

  Teachers have increased their efforts to maintain a high expectation for students of all racial backgrounds, to treat all students fairly and to provide equal opportunities to all students in doing more challenging tasks.

- *Staff composition*

  The number of racial minority role models in positions of authority (principals and vice-principals) increased substantially between 1990-91 and 1994-95.

- *Parental involvement*

  Parents of all racial backgrounds agreed that they have been made to feel welcome to visit the school, talk to staff and participate in school activities because of the caring, supportive attitudes of school staff and their professionalism in making the school contacts a positive experience.

The respondents felt that the strong leadership roles played by the Wards 11/12 School Superintendent, school administrators and a core group of teachers have facilitated the translation of the ARE plans into practice.

Challenges to be met

- *Curriculum materials*

  ARE materials are still lacking in some specific areas (e.g., music, environmental studies), especially for the younger grade levels and for certain racial/ethnic minority groups. Materials that are contemporary and culturally authentic are also in short supply.

- *Readiness of students to take social action*

  While students have demonstrated their willingness to take a stand and speak up against racism in school, in their family circle and in their immediate neighbourhood, they generally feel powerless to take action at the level of the wider society.

- *School awards*

  Asian students are still underrepresented in sport and music/art awards.

- *Special Education program placement*

  The selection and placement processes of students in the gifted programs need further monitoring to ensure that students of all racial backgrounds are represented proportionally.

- *Staff attitudes towards ARE*

  A small group of teachers still resist ARE because they do not see racism as a problem, think ARE is extra work for them and are concerned that ARE has put undue emphasis on racial/ethnic minority students.

- *Teacher treatment of students*

  Some minority parents feel that the treatment and expectations of immigrant children, especially ESL students, could be improved.

- *Teacher in-service needs*

  More than half of the teachers want in-service related to "turning students' awareness and knowledge into social action".

- *Racial composition of school staff*

  There is a need to monitor the racial compositions of teachers, administrators and other support staff to ensure that they reflect the demographic make-up of the community.

- *Parental support for ARE*

  There are signs that some parents oppose ARE initiatives because they feel that too many of the resources have gone into ARE and not enough attention is given to the academic studies and students who are *not* racial/ethnic minorities.

- *Parental involvement*

  Racial/ethnic minority parents may not be as involved with their schools as White parents in various types of school contacts despite their feelings of a welcoming school atmosphere. In addition, the nature of contacts with racial/ethnic minority parents need to be monitored, especially the disproportionately large number of problem-oriented contacts with parents of Black students.

Principals tend to think that the impact of ARE has taken root in Wards 11/12 and will outlast the tenure of the School Superintendent who initiated the project. The conviction that ARE needs to continue in this family of schools is also evident from the data.

Contents

Introduction 2
- Background of the study . . . 2
- Origin and objectives of the study . . . 3
- Data collection methods . . . 4

Findings 5
- What was the extent of support for ARE in the Wards 11/12 schools? . . . 5
- How did the Wards 11/12 schools implement ARE? . . . 7
  - Strategies to increase awareness and support for ARE . . . 7
  - Strategies to integrate ARE themes into the formal and informal curriculum . . . 7
  - Strategies to promote ARE materials and to weed out inappropriate materials . . . 12
  - Strategies to enhance the self-esteem of students from all backgrounds . . . 13
  - Strategies to help students of all racial backgrounds to improve on their school achievement . . . 14
  - Strategies to ensure equity in Special Education program identification and placement . . . 15
  - Strategies to increase the representation of racial minority staff . . . 16
  - Strategies to create and maintain a racism-free and positive school climate . . . 17
  - Strategies to increase parental involvement . . . 18
- What kinds of changes have occurred after four years of implementing ARE? . . . 19
  - Curriculum content and teaching practices . . . 19
  - Curriculum materials and library books . . . 22
  - Staff level of comfort and attitudes towards ARE . . . 23
  - Teachers' expectations and treatment of students . . . 25
  - Students' awareness and willingness to take social action . . . 28
  - Students' self-esteem . . . 30
  - Students' school achievement . . . 31
  - Special Education program placement . . . 33
  - Racial composition of school staff . . . 34
  - School climate . . . 35
  - Parental involvement . . . 37
- Suggestions for future implementation . . . 39
- Factors that facilitated or hindered the implementation of ARE . . . 40
- The future of ARE . . . 46
  - The viability of ARE . . . 46
  - The need to continue with ARE . . . 47
- Limitations of the study . . . 49

Summary and discussion 50

APPENDIX 1. Data Collection Methods for the Anti-Racist Education Project in Wards 11/12 . . . 62

Reference List 64

Tables

Table 1: Strategies teachers used to integrate ARE into their curriculum and classroom practices 8
Table 2: Survey of parents of Grades 3-8 students in Wards 11/12 schools, 1994-95 53
Table 3: Survey of all teachers in Wards 11/12 schools, 1991-92 and 1994-95 55
Table 4: Survey of Grades 3-8 students in Wards 11/12 schools, 1994-95 . . .57
Table 5: Survey of Grades 3-8 students in Wards 11/12 schools, 1991-92 . . .59
Table 6: Racial composition of administrative staff in Wards 11/12 schools .61

Anti-Racism

by Ryan Mohammed

Perth P.S.

I hate racism, a lot.
It hurts people's feelings.
I feel like I could chop it.
Then I could hook on anti and stop it.
Racism starts wars
And makes people feel ashamed of their colour.
One day Racism
Anti will find you
And will stick on you and make you feel like an old ripped up shoe!!

Source: Kids at Work, Education Week, May 5-11, 1991

Anti-Racism

by Farakh Arshad and Naila Khan

Pauline P.S.

White, black,
Brown or red,
It doesn't matter-
What colour you are.
Tamil, Spanish,
Indian, Chinese,
It doesn't matter
What language you speak.
We're all the same,
So don't treat people
The way you don't want
To be treated.

Source: Kids at Work, Education Week, May 1-5, 1995

Introduction

Background of the study

The Toronto Board has been committed to countering racism and promoting equity for students of all racial-cultural backgrounds since the 1970s. In 1979, the Board completed the Final Report of Sub-committee on Race Relations which contains 119 recommendations that address ethnic/race relations as they affect curriculum, assessment and placement, racial incidents in schools, extra-curricular activities, staff development, hiring and promotion and equal opportunity programming. These recommendations, which included deliberate, structured change to eradicate racial bias at the institutional and individual levels, became the basis for the Board's present anti-racist education policy.[1]

In the early 1990s, the Board once again declared anti-racist education as one of its curriculum priorities. In the Curriculum Implementation Priorities (1990-92) document (Toronto Board of Education, 1990), it was stated that:

> *Anti-racist education must be a fundamental component of all education, and is not a "subject", nor is it subject-specific. It must permeate the curriculum from kindergarten to OAC.*

In response, the School Superintendent in Wards 11 and 12 made anti-racist education (ARE) a thrust in his family of schools.[2] He worked with each of his schools to incorporate anti-racist education into various aspects of their school life and to submit, on an annual basis, a written plan for implementing ARE. Based on these plans, he provided the necessary support and resources for the schools to translate their plans into practice.

The ARE local school plans

The ARE local school plans required by the School Superintendent were developed through a 'democratic and collegial process' in each school by a small team of principals and teachers, with input from the rest of the school staff. Although each school had a slightly different focus, the major goals articulated in the local plans across the schools had many common elements which can be summarized as follows:

- to help students develop a healthy racial/cultural identity and pride in one's own background, culture or heritage;
- to promote students' self-acceptance, self-respect and self-esteem;
- to help students identify prejudice, discrimination, and stereotyping and develop strategies to challenge social inequities and injustices;
- to develop long-term positive racial ethnic relations among students by way of:

1. The Board re-affirmed its commitment to equity policies through an update of the above mentioned report in 1984, entitled Race Relations Program, Phase II and a conference on anti-racist education in 1989.

2. This family of schools is located in an area bounded by Bloor Street, St. Clair, Keele Street and Bathurst Street. The racial composition of the student population is quite heterogeneous, with White students making up slightly less than half of the population, Asians about a quarter, Blacks about one-fifth and 'Others' about one-tenth. According to the 1991 Census, these two wards have a large proportion of individuals in the low-income categories and high unemployment rate of 10-24%.

- acquiring knowledge, awareness and appreciation of other cultures and world views;
- appreciating and celebrating differences; and
- relating to each other in a positive way through cross-cultural work and play groups.

o to promote excellence in the context of equity; i.e., to help students of all racial-ethnic backgrounds to gain in academic expectations and achievement.

> As one vice-principal put it: *"Through ARE, we hope to help students achieve to the best of their ability and to ensure that minority students have the same privileges as Anglo kids."*
>
> Another vice-principal reported: *"Certainly one of the main goals of ARE is for children of all backgrounds to do well academically, personally and socially."*
>
> A third principal said: *"The ultimate goal of ARE, in a sense, is to promote good education for all students."*

The local school plans also contained a variety of implementation strategies (e.g., strategies to improve the school achievement of all students, measures to improve the level of parental involvement for all racial backgrounds) designed to meet the ARE goals described above. For more detailed information about the strategies described in the local school plans, please see Cheng & Soudack (1992a.)

Origin and objectives of the study

In 1991, the School Superintendent of Wards 11/12 made a request of Research Services to systematically monitor the implementation of anti-racist education in his jurisdiction for several years, so that the research information can be used by the schools to reflect on their practices and to make adjustments to their ARE plans.

A research proposal was then drafted with input from the School Superintendent and a few of the principals and vice-principals in Wards 11/12 -- data collection methods and sampling procedures were considered. The final research proposal was vetted by members of the Anti-racist Steering Committee in this family of schools and then submitted to the School Programs Committee for funding.

In January of 1992, the research plans and funding for the first year of the study were approved by the School Programs Committee of the Toronto Board of Education. This enabled Research Services to hire a contract researcher to assist in the initial development of instruments and co-ordination of data collection. In the subsequent school years (1992-93, 1994-95), data gathering was scaled down and continued by the regular staff.

A series of interim reports have been prepared to summarize the findings at the end of Year One, Year Two and Year Four.[3] (These reports are available upon request.) Brief presentations of the results have also been made to the staff in the Wards 11/12 schools on various occasions.

---

3. Although the ARE implementation still continues in this family of schools, the research project ended in Year Four. Data collection in Year Three was skipped to provide the schools a break in research activities.

This summary report is designed to meet the following objectives:

- to describe the extent of parent, staff and student support for ARE in the Wards 11/12 schools by Year Four;
- to document what the Wards 11/12 schools have done to implement ARE between Year One and Year Four;
- to report on the changes brought about by implementing ARE over four years;
- to summarize the suggestions for future implementation of ARE;
- to identify the factors that promote or hinder the implementation of ARE; and
- to describe the principals' perceptions about the future of ARE in Wards 11/12 schools.

Data collection methods

Data collection activities began in the second term of the 1991-92 school year (or Year One of the study) and ended in the summer of 1994-95 (Year Four), with no data gathering in Year Three. A variety of research methods were used, which included:

- surveys of all classroom teachers and a sample of students and parents;
- individual interviews with all principals/vice-principals, a sample of teacher-librarians and the School Superintendent;
- focus group interviews with samples of teachers, students and parents;
- tracking of racial incidents, student awards, gifted program enrolments, parental contacts with school staff and subsequent program placement of students in secondary school;
- observations of student interactions by teachers in the school yards; and
- collection of student writings on their personal feelings about racial incidents.

(See Appendix 1 for more details about the data gathering procedures.)

Findings

What was the extent of support for ARE in the Wards 11/12 schools?

The majority of the parents who responded to the survey in 1995 supported the idea of ARE (83%), thought it was important (83%) and felt a need to have it in their children's school (73%). (See Table 2.)[4] A further breakdown of the survey data shows that there was majority support (64%-91%) from each of the three major racial groups (Asian, Black and White), although the degree of support may vary among the groups on these questionnaire items.

A large majority of the teachers (90%) who responded to the 1995 survey were also supportive of the philosophy of ARE. Eighty percent indicated that they "treat ARE as one of the top priorities in their teaching" and 61% felt "a need to have ARE in their schools". (See Table 3.)[5] The support of ARE in the Wards 11/12 schools is confirmed by the observation of a new principal who had been transferred to this family of schools in early 1995. She said: *"Most staff in this school are giving a lot of support to ARE and it was obvious in the school atmosphere when I joined the school this last year."*

In addition, the support for ARE was evident in the interviews with principals, teachers and parents and the reasons they gave in support of ARE can be classified as follows:

1. Racism is alive in the larger society.

   One principal pointed out that: *"The daily newspaper reminds us that racism is here to stay. It is always in the forefront. We are living in a dangerous time now. The Heritage Front is making a strong presence. People are beginning to question whether we are on the right track. I notice people are not as afraid to make remarks which are "racist" in cocktail parties or in the media as before. Therefore, we should continue to be vigilant in countering racism."*

2. The change in demography requires us to work with a student body which has become very multi-cultural and multi-racial.

   One of the principals said: *"The population of our students is so mixed, we can't run the school smoothly unless we have anti-racist education. The majority of the staff saw the value of the ARE philosophy because of the change in demography; as a result, there is no other way to live. We have to show respect for kids of all racial ethnic backgrounds. They have to see us as role models."*

3. Anti-racist education is the system's way of reaffirming students' racial/cultural backgrounds.

---

4. For information about the response rate of parents, please refer to the Table notes.

5. For information about the response rate of teachers, please refer to the Table notes.

One teacher commented that: *"Anti-racist education is a validation and recognition of who we are, and the sense of being valued can affect the learning of students in a positive way."*[6]

4. The absence of racism can help students to focus their energy in their studies.

   One Black parent felt that: *"ARE should definitely be at the top of the school's priorities, because other things will eventually fall into place when racism is taken care of."*

5. Anti-racist education promotes harmony and better relationships in the school.

   A teacher-librarian said: *"ARE must continue because it sends a very strong message to our students, staff and communities that we live in a society of different cultures. It promotes a better understanding and tolerance. Ignorance breeds intolerance. Hopefully education and knowledge will lead to harmony."*

   A Latin American parent also agreed that: *"Anti-racism can help students and parents of different cultures to cooperate and work together. So it is good for both my family and kids."*

6. Anti-racist education can lead to a better future for the country.

   A parent felt strongly that: *"It is important to have ARE not only in Toronto, but in all of Canada, because both Canada and Toronto are becoming more and more cosmopolitan, but racial minority groups are still experiencing a lot of racial harassment and discrimination. I want to see Canada and Toronto remain one of the best countries and cities in the world."*

   A vice-principal expressed a similar idea this way: *"If you walk down Yonge street or any place a little away from here, it's like a whole world within Toronto. It's such a mixer right here. At this school alone we have about 55 different ethnic groups and it is more and more diverse. Because we have them from all over the world, it has become more the globe, except we don't learn to get along with each other. What future is there for us as a nation?"*

---

6. Conversely, if students do not feel that their backgrounds are acknowledged and validated, then they will feel "invisible and insignificant," have "no space for their voices in the classroom discourse" and "might disengage from the educational process." (James, 1994, p.27.)

How did the Wards 11/12 schools implement ARE?

This section documents how the schools carried out the mandate of implementing ARE in their daily school life. The information was collected from the schools' local ARE plans, through interviews with principals and teachers and from the open-ended responses on teacher surveys.

Strategies to increase awareness and support for ARE

Staff training was provided before the implementation of the ARE local school plans, to help staff members increase their awareness about the need for ARE, and to acquire knowledge and skills for carrying out the ARE plans.[7] Some examples include:

- A three-day in-service training for principals and vice-principals by outside consultants;
- Training for teacher reps (who were the race relations reps for the schools) and subject consultants who served the Wards 11/12 schools;
- In-service of school staff by the Board's own Staff Development Department personnel;
- The use of a P.D. day (Professional Development day) to launch the local plans;
- Special training for the school librarians; and
- Book fairs held in the various schools to familiarize teachers with ARE materials.

In addition, there were on-going in-service training sessions for staff after the launch of ARE in the schools. For example, there were P.D. sessions that occurred on a yearly basis as well as periodic workshops for teachers. The topics of staff development covered many areas, e.g., name calling, cultural/heritage celebrations, ESL/D issues, bias in books, co-operative learning, writing with an ARE focus, techniques in developing ARE themes in the curriculum, an introduction to the ARE kits for the primary/junior students, and background information on a Caribbean artist prior to his art exhibit in the Wards 11/12 schools. Finally, an annual student-parent conference was organized to educate students and their parents about ARE.

Strategies to integrate ARE themes into the formal and informal curriculum

In the Year One and Year Four surveys, teachers were asked to provide information on how they integrated anti-racist education into their curriculum plans and classroom practices. Table 1 summarizes the strategies teachers described on the two surveys.

---

7. The target groups for staff development were mostly classroom teachers, teacher reps, teacher-librarians, vice-principals and principals. In some instances, International Language instructors and school support staff such as educational assistants and administrative assistants, were also invited to participate.

Table 1: Strategies teachers used to integrate ARE into their curriculum and classroom practices

A: PROGRAM AREAS
1. Arts • Visual arts - drawing/painting, e.g., cultural portraiture, skin colour; crafts from around the world, e.g., origami, Caribana headgear, Kwansea placemats • Drama, role-playing on racism • Music/songs from around the world e.g., invite parents from different culture to bring in music (tapes and records) • Dance national/international, e.g., Magic Carpet dance from Arabia • Cultural theme units, e.g., discuss history, artwork of different cultures (Black African, Aztec, Inuit, etc.); discuss and appreciate contributions/cultural differences in art, music, dance
2. Language • Increased use of ARE reading materials, e.g., novel sets, picture books depicting children from other races/skin colours, racial conflict • Stories/folktales from around the world (global content) reflecting cultural diversity • Special ARE theme units, e.g., study units on racism, justice and fairness, hero units (e.g., Martin Luther King, Nelson Mandela) • Increased availability of authors from different countries/anthologies • Encourage ARE reading activities, e.g., borrow-a-book, story-telling • Other, e.g., videos on ARE, ARE writing assignments, pen pal programs with Native Canadian and foreign children
3. Mathematics, Science and Technology • Discuss history/contributions of scientists/inventors from different cultures e.g., Asians, Africans, Native Americans (Mayans, Aztecs) • Math from other cultures, origins and influences, e.g., African math • Use graphs to show where students are born and what home language they speak • Use multicultural math resource materials/booklets • Use math games from around the world • Other, e.g., farming, cooking around the world, activities representing other cultures

4. Self and Society

- Increased classroom discussion re: ARE themes e.g., prejudice/discrimination, personal experience, human rights, tolerance
- ARE and the media, e.g., discuss world events and local community events on racist issues; teach students techniques to detect biases in TV ads and propaganda
- Discussions about different countries/cultures, holiday celebrations, religious practices, e.g., guest volunteer speakers from various cultures
- Self-esteem activities, e.g., Magic/Learning Circle, Advisor/Advisee program participation
- Other, e.g., family trees, interviewing a family member, objects important to family/heritage for show and tell, school assembly themes, e.g., "Our Vision for Anti-Racism in the World"

B: CURRICULUM MATERIALS AND TECHNIQUES

- Use new story books, text books, work books and videos that reflect multiracial/anti-racist/equity foci, e.g., multicultural math resource booklets, Sunshine books, Literacy 2000, women in science, novel sets
- Use books reflecting first language/ethnic origin of students
- Use TBE program kits, e.g., S.T.A.R.S. Equity Advisor Kit, ARE Study Kit
- Display/use posters and pictures depicting multiracial/anti-racist themes
- Use multiracial dolls and puppets
- Other, e.g., use a variety of materials such as origami, puzzles, games, clothing, utensils and housekeeping materials from different cultures, special celebration objects, "people colours" crayons and paper; establish borrow-a-book program; weed library books for negative stereotyping

C: STUDENT EVALUATION AND ASSESSMENT - TECHNIQUES

- Take cultural background/home environment into account; make modification/adjustment/allowance for differences in accent, skills, abilities
- Use a variety of methods, observation, anecdotal records, parent input, class work, comparison of students' current work to previous work, holistic assessment, minimize formal testing
- When evaluating in reference to Benchmarks, choose ARE materials; evaluate a wide range of knowledge, skills and values, e.g., level of enthusiasm and participation (music), listening skills, respect shown towards others in Learning Circle
- Use interpreters/translations at parents interviews; involve social workers/school-community advisor in assessment
- Other, e.g., give regular feedback and encouragement, allow group assessment, include self-assessment

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

The interview data also provided many examples of activities inside and outside of the classrooms that school staff have attempted in order to make anti-racist education part of school life. The many examples cited by principals and teachers include the following approaches:

1. Integration of ARE into different program/subject areas: e.g., Science, Mathematics, Humanities, Arts, Language

   "A few years ago, our curriculum theme was on Native study, and we tried to integrate all subject matter into that. This year, although our focus is on math and science, we will still use an anti-racist approach, so that we don't separate the two things. Once we have a decent math and science plan in place, it is not difficult to plug in anti-racist education. If you look across the globe and see where the inventions originate, you can easily tie in the contributions of the various ethnic and cultural groups. You pose a problem to the students such as 'How did the Black inventor come up with a device to help stop the elevator?'. It is really simple to bring anti-racist education into the curriculum." (A principal)

   "We have certainly been doing something on anti-racism and equity, sometimes at the school-wide level, but more often in individual classes. For example, we have a teacher in the junior grades who has just finished doing a unit around the Holocaust. The Grade 8s have also finished a play called 'Lisa' which is about a young woman in the Holocaust. And, prior to the play, the students had to get familiar with a novel about the Holocaust." (A vice-principal)

   In another school, the topics of "Holocaust" and "anti-Semitism" were covered in a Grade 7 class as part of the anti-racist education plan. The vice-principal commented that: *"The kids became so sensitized, you should see the sorts of things they wrote, as if they themselves were there experiencing the Holocaust. They talked about interpersonal relationships and how it should be. The teachers' interest and enthusiasm has escalated and ended up in a series of workshops on anti-semitism. They are now ready to take it into other racial areas and cultural groups."*

   "Last year, we worked with the paintings of Boodhoo, a Caribbean artist, from Kindergarten through grade 8. The paintings were housed in the library and the students did critical analyses of the paintings. They were also made aware of this particular Caribbean artist and other artists as visible minorities, Black in this instance. We succeeded in heightening their awareness that we have Black artists loved by all cultures and that we have people in all cultures who are famous painters." (A vice-principal)

   A teacher talked about how she teaches her students to think critically about equity issues whenever she gets a chance. This is a practice various anti-racist writers agree should be "placed at the heart of the anti-racist education project." (Reed, 1994, p. 15). Although the specific example this teacher gave was a poem about a group of boys excluding a girl from their hockey team, she said the issues are generic enough to apply to racism and other types of inequalities. The questions she posed to her students included: *"Is it wrong to discriminate based on certain characteristics of the person?" "Why is it wrong?" "What are the problems associated with thinking that girls can't make it in hockey?" "Is there another way of looking at the matter other than the traditional way?" "Are there changes that can be made to create equal opportunities?" "What would those changes be?"*

2. Integration of ARE into different school activities

Several teachers mentioned that in addition to the formal inclusive curriculum in which teachers assign projects on multicultural themes and use books and materials representative of the student population, there are steel drums music, community choir and many songs from other cultures and International Language classes during the regular school day. One of the teachers pointed out that the validation of the children's backgrounds comes from a range of activities and sources in the school. She said: *"Every term, an ARE activity week is scheduled, such as doing origami, making ethnic Caribbean masks, or telling stories about Chinese immigrant women. These are followed by question and answer discussions."*

"Last year, we published a book of children's stories from all over the world. These are stories with which kids from various backgrounds can identify. It was something that involved many people working together: students, teachers, the non-teaching staff, parents and grandparents." (A principal)

"We have special events such as Heroes Day to help raise awareness of ARE in a fun and instructional way. Each class defined a hero from a different culture, such as Martin Luther King, through poems, illustrations, drama, etc., which was then presented at a school assembly. Each class was also visited on a rotation basis by the other classes and exchanged knowledge of the heroes." (A principal)

"We took part in a welcoming ceremony for Nelson Mandela a couple of years ago and we discussed the situation about apartheid. It had also led to a discussion about Martin Luther King. The children were really interested. It really pulled their attention because of the dose of reality in this situation." (A teacher)

A vice-principal mentioned that her school deals with the issues of racism and equity in their assemblies on a regular basis as one example of how ARE has been ingrained in the fabric of school activities in her school.

Another principal mentioned that anti-racist education is an integral part of their school life in that it has become a regular agenda item on their biweekly staff meeting. During the meeting, *"the ARE reps who attend the Ward or Board ARE committees report on what is happening across the Ward or the Board. It is an accepted part of the regular staff meeting agenda. It's not an add on. ARE is part of our regular routine and regular life at school."*

3. Extension of ARE into the International Language and daycare programs

A few principals reported that their teachers work closely with the instructors from the International Language programs which are integrated in the regular school day (as opposed to having the program after-school or on the weekends). The regular teachers sometimes invite the International Language instructors to come into their classes to talk to the students. They also work with the instructors across the cultures to put on celebrations at different times of the year and at the end of the year.

In some schools, the integration extends to the daycare. One principal said: *"We try to make daycare a part of school, because we are dealing with the same students. We involve the daycare in different activities we have around different cultures; we also let them use the library and borrow our multicultural books."*

Strategies to promote ARE materials and to weed out inappropriate materials

The school-librarians in the Wards 11/12 schools were asked to describe how they promoted anti-racist materials, that is, materials that relate to the day-to-day experiences of students of diverse backgrounds and help to provide context and relevance for their school activities and learning. The school-librarians talked about initiatives such as:

1. Monitoring new releases and informing classroom teachers of new ARE materials through notices, newsletters, review meetings and workshops;

2. Being a resource to classroom teachers by meeting their requests for specific materials, e.g., Ramadan, Kwanza, Hannukah, Christmas; letting teachers know what materials are available for Black History Month; informing teachers of videos for Chinese New Year;

   "We do the partnership thing. I ask teachers at the beginning of year for their study themes and schedules. I prepare it for them ahead of time, e.g., holidays, celebrations, ARE and non-ARE topics."

3. Organizing special events/programs in the library to teach students to respect cultural differences and to affirm their racial/ethnic backgrounds;

   - Showing films; setting up seminars/book talks/forums for students; staging special activities, e.g., "potluck" meals prepared by families from different cultures; displaying anti-racist books, videos and posters; setting up theme tables, e.g. displaying a laminated set of mini-biographies on famous Black people during the Black History Month which helps to integrate history with the contributions of Black Canadians;
   - Responding to specific ARE questions, e.g., turning a child's question on swastika to a discussion on racism and referring the child to other related materials such as Diary of Anne Frank;
   - Storytelling which introduces kids to folk-tales and books with an ARE content, e.g , World War II, Holocaust, Japanese Internment, Vietnam war.

4. Selecting and purchasing relevant print and non-print materials; using expertise to advise teachers on their book purchases;

5. Weeding out materials that are inconsistent with the ARE philosophy and replacing them with materials that promote ARE. The criteria described by a number of teacher-librarians and principals in Wards 11/12 include:[8]

   - Old/outdated content items and artwork, e.g., stereotypes of Native Indians; books on indigenous peoples that do not illustrate today's reality;
   - Materials that contain insulting language, e.g., "natives" as "savages", "Indians" or "Eskimos";
   - Books that contain gender stereotypes or refer to women in a degrading way;
   - Materials that reflect a certain culture in a single aspect only, e.g., Chinese in traditional costumes;

---

8. Although the Board's central office has some general guidelines for weeding inappropriate materials, they are not specific enough for ARE, so the schools have to come up with their own specific criteria.

- Other criteria: publication dates, colours of the illustrations, content, size of the print and the attractiveness of the cover.

During the interviews, a few of the teachers felt a little ambivalent about the issue of weeding books. One of them said: *"I think it's good that we remove all the literature which has racist references from our schools. But, it would be even better if we controlled this and had that kind of material read to children and then discussed it. By removing it from everyone's view, it becomes a non-issue. I think it's important for kids to have the awareness."* Consequently, in some schools, teachers are allowed to keep some of the books identified for weeding and use them as examples of stereotyping for class discussions.

Strategies to enhance the self-esteem of students from all backgrounds

Most school staff believed that a link exists between the self-esteem of students and their academic achievement. One principal expressed her viewpoint this way: *"If a child feels happy and at ease, academic improvement is a consequence. Along with positive self-esteem changes are positive changes in academic achievement."*

Some school staff also believed that self-esteem and academic achievement influence each other in a cyclical way. One vice-principal said: *"Students need to feel good about themselves (e.g. their racial identities) in order to produce well. But teachers also need to make all students work very hard to achieve to the best of their abilities. When students feel good about themselves because of their good work, they will continue to produce well."* Some literature described the latter kind of feeling good about oneself as "earned self-esteem" or "justified self-esteem". (Bray, 1990; Willis, 1990). This school administrator also saw *"improving the [earned] self-esteem of students as a means to an end which is equity in academic outcomes."*

A wide variety of activities were employed to build up the self-esteem of students in Wards 11/12. They include:

1. Satisfying the basic needs of students without hurting their pride

   "Improving or keeping self-esteem intact is critical: staff philosophy is 'help first, no words said', e.g., the staff will feed the kids who come to school hungry, provide mittens and socks from a local shelter, etc., in a discreet manner, with no questions asked. All of these help to maintain dignity and an atmosphere of care and support." (A principal)

2. Showing respect for the students

   "It is critical to have a polite staff who have a good ear, are non-opinionated and (in particular) do not discipline kids openly in the office area. Students are disciplined in a private place so that they can focus on their behaviours and so that their self-esteem is not threatened further by the raising of voices, etc., in front of a number of adults in the main office area." (A principal)

3. Publicly recognizing students' achievements through awards -

   - by putting up the pictures of students along with their awards in the principal's office or in the school's display showcase; by recognizing student

accomplishments at an assembly or special award ceremony; by inviting parents and others to come and take pictures with students who won the awards;

- by providing opportunities for more students to be recognized through establishing awards that place equal emphasis on academic and non-academic aspects of school life. One principal explained:

> *"We used to have only a few students getting awards at graduation (for the most advanced students in language arts, math and so on). To make things equitable and to recognize that students can make contributions in other ways, we now have an award system where each child gets an award sticker on their certificate for a range of contributions they made (e.g., leadership, volunteering in the wider community, sports, peer tutor). So they know whatever efforts they made are valued and recognized. This is an equitable way of spreading the awards around."*

4. Providing workshops, discussion groups, theatrical presentations to help students understand self-esteem;

5. Recognizing the students' various cultural backgrounds through displays which reflect all cultural events throughout the year; celebrating special occasions such as the Black History Month;

6. Providing positive adult role models from the visible minority community;

7. Providing information for students and staff regarding the past and present contributions made by members of visible minorities, e.g., Black inventors.

Strategies to help students of all racial backgrounds to improve on their school achievement

As mentioned above, some staff felt that boosting self-esteem, without improving achievement, cannot bring about equity in academic outcomes. Hence many schools saw affirming students' self-worth and improving their academic achievement as twin goals. Principals and teachers gave many examples of initiatives taken by Wards 11/12 schools to help students of all racial/ethnic backgrounds to achieve success in school. These include:

1. Helping students in literacy skills

   One vice-principal mentioned that: *"We have an emphasis on literacy, because reading is important. We offer an after-school reading program, mostly attended by minority kids. There is no better way to boost the kids' self-esteem than to have them learn how to read."*

   Another vice-principal indicated that: *"We have consultants working full-time with staff to raise language levels. Teachers read to the class everyday. Kids read to each other and make use of the school library program which promotes regular reading. All of these breed literacy."*

2. Helping students in mathematical skills

   One administrator said: *"We take the students that we know have definite gaps in multiplication, division or geometry and work with them for the first four, five or six weeks to try to increase their confidence level and also their mathematical ability."*

3. Helping students in abstract reasoning skills

   "When we did class profiles, we found that a lot of our kids throughout the school were not very adept in abstract reasoning, so we bought some books and novel kits that were theme-oriented. The themes include topics on how to live in an equitable society and other topics that students are interested in. Hopefully, through the discussions and task assignments in the kits, our children will become better critical thinkers and therefore have more abstract reasoning skills." (A vice-principal)

4. Providing remedial help for children with educational gaps

   In most cases, remedial help comes in the form of mentoring or tutoring by teachers or secondary school students from a neighbourhood secondary school; sometimes tutorial programs are held in a neighbourhood center.

5. Helping students through alternative ways of structuring the classes

   "The integrated model we use here helps to make academic improvement happen. This model enables teachers to have only half a class for part of the day and allows the teacher to do a lot of remedial work during that time. Rotary is at a minimum. The kids are mostly with one classroom teacher who knows a lot about each child's capabilities and can program to help the child meet the high expectation of teachers." (A vice-principal)

6. Helping students through smaller class size

   Some schools place a high priority on keeping class sizes low to facilitate more effective programming for New Canadians with little or no formal schooling and entering the junior and senior grades.

7. Promoting high academic expectations for all students as a high priority in all classrooms

8. Involving parents in the children's homework assignments.

Strategies to ensure equity in Special Education program identification and placement

Some of the strategies implemented by this family of schools to promote equity in identification and placement of students in Special Education include:

- Assigning a small group of staff to work on a booklet to help teachers identify giftedness in students from different backgrounds and become advocates for these students;

- Involving the Special Education consultants to work more closely with the Local School Teams in the identification and placement process; and

- Paying more attention to the questions of "Who are the students coming to IPRC (Identification, Placement and Review Process)?" and "What are their reasons for coming to IPRC?"

Strategies to increase the representation of racial minority staff

All groups in the study recognized that having a teaching staff which reflects the composition of the student population is one important component of anti-racist education. The reasons given by the various groups for increasing the representation of minority staff include:

1. Minority teachers can serve as role models for both minority and mainstream students.

   One parent said: *"It is important for minority kids to have role models in school with whom they can identify."*

   A principal elaborated on this point by saying: *"One advantage of having minority teachers in the school is that you can tell the minority students, 'Here is a minority teacher, you can finish high school and be a teacher too.' White and minority students need to see that people of all racial groups can be in any career."*

   White teachers also agreed that there should be more minority role models in schools. One of them said: *"I think it is good for kids to see people who look like themselves in the teaching career. But it's just the first step. That's not anti-racist education in and of itself."*

2. Minority teachers can facilitate the implementation of anti-racist education.

   A vice-principal argued: *"The reason why teachers are not moving as quickly as I would want them to in anti-racist education and equity issues is because the staff are not reflective of the population out there. The more you get that mix, the better is the chance that anti-racist education is being offered to the children."*

3. Minority staff can relate better to minority students and help them more effectively.

   A Black vice-principal recalled an incident in which a Black student preferred to talk to her instead of his classroom teacher about a concern: *"It turned out that the problem had nothing to do with race. Then I said: 'You could have dealt with this with your teacher or with the principal', but the child said: 'I choose to talk to you because you will understand.' He felt he could relate to me because we are of the same racial-ethnic background. I think our staff must reflect the population out there if we really want to be effective."*

   One racial minority teacher-librarian made a parallel remark. She said: *"Minority kids open up when they are with me because librarians are mostly Caucasian and I represent a minority group. Every-day exposure to minority role models is important. My experience as a minority helps to provide a foundation for building a deeper relationship with minority students. You really have to experience things first hand to help the kids."*

Students also agreed. One Asian student pointed out: *"When a new kid who does not speak English comes to our school from Vietnam, a Vietnamese teacher can probably explain things to him or her in Vietnamese."*

4. Minority staff can provide special support to White staff.

   One Black vice-principal pointed out that: *"Some White teachers in my school have told me that they feel more comfortable having me present when they meet with minority parents."*

A number of administrators mentioned that they tried to make it a priority to recruit qualified minority teachers whenever vacancies occurred in their schools. Some of the strategies used to increase the representation of minority teachers at the Ward and school levels include:

- o setting up a Steering Committee on Hiring for Diversity;
- o providing in-house training for vice-principals and principals on interviewing techniques to minimize inadvertent biases against racial minority applicants;
- o creating a short list of qualified candidates for racial minorities and other target groups; and
- o increasing the general awareness that there is a need to have more racial minority teachers in the schools.

Strategies to create and maintain a racism-free and positive school climate

The strategies employed to create a learning environment conducive to the implementation of ARE can be categorized into three main areas:

1. Development and enforcement of a racial-ethnocultural harassment policy

   Many of the schools in Wards 11/12 have a specific racial-ethnocultural harassment policy in place, developed according to the Board policy and input from the school communities. These school policies usually outline procedures for staff to follow and spell out the consequences for violating such policies, which usually include a series of escalating disciplinary actions beginning with student reprimand and single day withdrawal and culminating in suspension.

   In most schools, these policies are announced in the assemblies and discussed in the classrooms on a regular basis to ensure that students and teachers are aware. Most importantly, these policies have been taken seriously by staff and strictly enforced.

2. Encouragement for students to develop positive intercultural/interracial relationships and friendships

   In addition to reacting to negative situations, the schools also encourage students to form cross-cultural and cross-racial friendships. One of the principals said: *"I think the lack of contacts with minority groups often becomes the basis for discrimination. When you get involved and integrated with peoples of different races, you don't notice the racial differences. This generation of children who grow up with school*

mates of mixed racial backgrounds don't think of racial differences because they grow up with it."

In the classrooms, most teachers provide opportunities for students to form work and play groups consisting of members from different racial-ethnic origins.

3. Maintenance of a clean, well-kept physical environment

   One principal also put a great emphasis on a clean, well-maintained school environment (e.g., she made sure that the caretakers clean the washrooms twice daily). She felt that it is important that the physical environment within the school reflects a warm, bright and cheerful ambience (e.g., she decorated the main office with flowers, a fish tank or poster display area, to promote conversation with parents and students.)

Strategies to increase parental involvement

Many strategies aimed at increasing parental involvement have been planned and tried out in the Wards 11/12 schools because these schools believe that a strong home-school liaison can help students improve in their academic achievement.[9] Some common practices include:

1. Using interpreters for phone calls, meetings and interviews with parents;
2. Translating notices, newsletters and other written communication for children to take home;
3. Having an open-door policy to encourage parents to drop by the school;
4. Organizing workshops to assist parents in understanding the various school programs and policies; and
5. Inviting parents to participate in classroom activities and special events or projects in support of the ARE theme.

(See Cheng & Soudack, 1992a; and Cheng, 1996d for more detailed examples of the strategies used in the Wards 11/12 schools.)

9. For a brief literature review on the relationship between parental involvement and school achievement please see Cheng (1996d).

What kinds of changes have occurred after four years of implementing ARE?

When principals, teachers, students and parents were asked to give their perceptions about the changes that have occurred since the implementation of ARE, they generally agreed that varying degrees of changes have taken place in the following areas:

1. curriculum content and teaching practices
2. curriculum materials and library books
3. teachers' level of comfort and attitudes towards racial issues, and willingness to take action
4. teachers' expectations and treatment of racial minority students
5. students' awareness of racial issues and willingness to take action
6. students' self-esteem
7. students' school achievement
8. Special Education program placement
9. racial composition of staff
10. school climate
11. parental involvement.

Some of the principals pointed out that ARE is no quick-fix to address the issue of equity in the schooling of a multiracial, multicultural student population. One principal said: *"We can't expect change overnight. Things are improving and moving in the right direction and that's the important thing."* Another vice-principal said: *"I have spoken about many positive changes, but I also want to make it crystal clear that we still have a long way to go in terms of equity."* A third principal said: *"We have to be careful that we don't think that four years of ARE can drastically change everything, but at least some positive changes have occurred."*

Curriculum content and teaching practices

Teachers' perceptions

The gradual integration of anti-racist education in the curriculum content and teaching strategies of the Wards 11/12 schools is evident in the responses of the Year Four (1994-95) teacher survey. Only a small proportion of the teacher respondents in 1995 thought it requires a great deal of extra effort (18%) and time (16%) to implement ARE in the classroom. Table 3 shows that:

1. Between 83% and 93% of the teachers indicated that they "often" or "very often"
    - o provide opportunities for cross-cultural and cross-racial interaction in work and play groups
    - o affirm or recognize the racial/ethnic backgrounds of all students in class
    - o provide opportunities for students from all racial groups to share their heritage and personal experiences in class.
2. Between 66% and 76% of the teachers reported that they "often" or "very often"
    - o instill in students a sense of responsibility in countering racism in their community
    - o talk about the contributions of peoples from a range of societies and cultures

- o have classroom practices and activities that recognize both the dominant and minority cultures
- o help children recognize, understand and challenge racism and social inequities.

3. About 50% of the teachers said that agreed that they "often" or "very often"

- o show racial minority persons in counter-stereotypical roles (either in materials, or as guest speakers or resource people)
- o provide opportunities to examine misconceptions about different groups.

The proportions of teacher respondents who indicated that they frequently adopt the above practices in their classrooms have increased slightly for the majority of the items between Year One and Year Four.

However, one area is implemented by very few teachers and that is to bring ARE outside of the classrooms to the larger community. For example, only 16% of the teachers surveyed in 1995 said they "often" or "very often" organize social actions related to ARE (e.g., initiate a letter writing campaign to protest negative stereotyping in the media.) (See Table 3.)[10] It was also apparent in the teacher and principal interviews that involving students in organized actions against social inequities was not widespread. One typical comment made was that most teachers have made great efforts to increase students' social awareness (such as looking at media images and identifying stereotypes), but have not gone further to encourage students to take social actions.

Principals' perceptions

In addition to the teacher survey data, there were many examples cited in the principal interviews that reinforced that anti-racist education has become part of the teachers' daily activities. The integration has become much more automatic, intuitive, on-going and intertwined with all subject areas by Year Four.

> *"ARE is totally integrated into the curriculum which is now quite inclusive. It is happening in writing and speaking and has become part of the automatic planning, and part of good teaching. There is no need for reminding staff." (A principal)*

> *"By now, the majority of teachers do carry an ARE curriculum; it is ongoing (e.g., talk on Remembrance Day, name-calling). (A vice-principal)*

> *"Staff are conscious of the ARE initiative in the school after they have been doing it for a few years. When they come across an idea or a book, they immediately link it to ARE and say: 'This is good for our ARE program.'" (A principal)*

> *"Just this morning, we had a Divisional meeting about the curriculum. It was a foregone conclusion that there would be a connection with anti-racist education. It's like one doesn't exist without the other. It's nothing that you have to necessarily think about. It's just part of what happens all the time. If you look at our plan, you can't separate everything in there. It's not a separate issue. It's not math and science and other subjects and then anti-racist education. ARE is in everything. It's not a separate issue anymore." (A principal)*

---

10. Since this question was not asked in 1991, no comparison can be made over time.

"Teachers are no longer seeing ARE as an add on. They see it as part of the school curriculum. It's intertwined, so they don't see it as extra work. It's ongoing. The children write about anti-racism things all the time -- not only in the Black History month in February." (A vice-principal)

Students' perceptions

Student survey results reinforced the teachers' self-reports on the implementation of an ARE curriculum. (See Table 4.)[11] Most students indicated in the 1995 survey that they:

- *Do not* learn things in school that make people from other races look bad (85%) [12]
- Learn about the countries that different kids in their school come from (81%)
- Learn things in school that make them proud to be who they are (73%)
- Hear about the holidays they celebrate at home (71%)
- Learn about what racism means in class (68%).

Parents' perceptions

The majority of the parents also "agreed" or "strongly agreed" that Wards 11/12 schools have implemented ARE in the curriculum. Table 2 shows that more than two-thirds of the parents from all racial groups felt that:

- The schools teach their children to respect all cultures in our society (80%)
- Racism in the teaching materials are properly dealt with by teaching staff (74%)
- The school lessons and activities take into consideration the differences in students' racial ethnic backgrounds (70%)
- The things their children learn in school make them proud to be who they are (69%).

When parents were asked how well the school environment reflects the racial/ethnic mix of the community, more than half of the Asian, Black and White parents (See Table 2) felt that the community is "well" or "very well" represented in the:

- Pictures and displays on walls (75%)
- Special events and celebrations (73%)
- After school extracurricular activities (67%)
- Lesson content (64%).

It is worth noting that there are sizable differences among the racial groups in some of their perceptions. For example, White parents (69%) are not as likely as Black (80%) and Asian

---

11. For information about the sample size and response rate of students, please refer to the Table notes.

12. This item was obtained from 100% minus the 15% of students who agreed that "some of the things they learn in school make people from some races look bad".

(74%) parents to agree that "the things my child learns in school make him/her feel proud to be who he/she is." A similar pattern was also found with the item on whether the lesson content (56%-73%) reflects well the cultural mix of its neighborhood. (See Table 2.)

Curriculum materials and library books

According to the various sources of data, there has been a noticeable increase in the variety, quality, availability and use of inclusive curriculum materials in the Wards 11/12 schools. The following quotes illustrate the changes that have taken place. It is evident that attempts have been made by schools to include library materials which reflect in a realistic manner the experiences and perceptions of a racially and culturally diverse population.

> *"One of the most positive things that has happened to us during the last few years is the collection of books and library materials. We have more variety, even in fairy tales, from different countries. Their availability has improved, and the content has become definitely more multicultural. In Kindergarten, we have books in two languages, both in English and another language such as Vietnamese, Chinese, and Portuguese. We have introduced a variety of novels and a variety of crayons in different skin colours. We have puzzles and games from around the world. Even the kind of book fairs we're having cater to our needs, and the kinds of books that are made available to teachers are quite racism free." (A teacher)*

> *"Library books are in heritage languages such as Chinese, Vietnamese and Spanish. There are also English books with themes with which students from different backgrounds can identify. An example of a book with which Asian students can identify is Everybody Eats Rice. Another book called the Lotus Seed is about the actual experience of a Vietnamese family that went through war, their journey to North America and how the child strives in the new environment.*
>
> *Not only is the content good, the colour and the pictures are appealing to children. There are also different cultural renditions of the same familiar stories such as Cinderella in Chinese, African and Egyptian. These books are here to encourage children to read, appreciate and make connections to their lives. Other books about racial/ethnic minorities and Native students include How many days to America?, Mama, do you love me?, and At the crossroads.*
>
> *The quality of pictures and colours are good. New books are often displayed conspicuously, so that students are aware of them and check them out." (A teacher-librarian)*

One minority parent agreed that: *"The library books that my kids bring home now are quite representative of the kids in the neighbourhood."* Another minority parent reinforced the same notion by saying: *"I find that the library books have a good representation of different cultures. If a kid wants to read about the country where he comes from, he can easily find something in the school library."*

Another teacher-librarian mentioned that: *"When I walk into the classrooms, it is obvious that teachers are using ARE materials. Their buying practices have definitely changed. During the last several ARE book sales, classes have*

stocked up on novels related to such topics as the Holocaust. Most teachers also have some ARE novels they've collected themselves. If you walk into the primary grade classrooms, you will see book cases with such books."

Teachers' perceptions

In both Year One and Year Four, the majority (81%, 86% respectively) of teachers indicated that they "use books and other curriculum materials that depict people from a range of societies and cultures". (See Table 3)

In addition, more than half of the teachers indicated that their curriculum materials are "well" or "very well" reflective of the ethnic/racial mix of their students in 1995 in all of the following areas (See Table 3):

- Math and science displays and materials (94%)
- Book collection (79%)
- Pictures and materials on the wall (69%)
- Art and music displays and materials (54%)
- Toys, games, props, supplies, etc. (53%).

These percentages represent large increases in every category between 1991-92 and 1994-95, with the biggest increases in "math and science displays and materials" (from 40% to 94%) and "toys, games, props, supplies, etc." (from 29% to 53%).

Students' perceptions

When students were asked their opinions in 1995 about the books and materials they use in school (See Table 4), about half of them said they:

- are exposed to books that include people like them in the stories and pictures (51%); and
- like the way their school books talk about them and their families (46%).

Parents' perceptions

In the 1995 parent survey (See Table 2), the majority of the Asian, Black and White parents (66-76%) agreed that the book collection in the library reflects "well" or "very well" the ethnic/racial mix of the community.

Staff level of comfort and attitudes towards ARE

In terms of change in attitude, principals remarked that their own attitudes have changed after taking part in ARE.

"People have changed, we ourselves have changed in the way we look at the issues of racism. It is rewarding from that point of view."

"Oh, it's rewarding in a sense that you grow up, and that you learn, and that you change, and that you end up feeling better about yourself."

Similar changes were also found in the teachers. For example:

1. Teachers feel more comfortable talking about racial issues, dealing with racial incidents and integrating anti-racist themes in their classrooms.

   "Teachers are now more open to talk about racial issues in the newspaper and sensitive things that have happened in the school. They deal with these things in a much more open manner than they did before." (A principal)

   "Due to the ARE thrust, I feel there is an open, warm welcome to discuss freely the holidays celebrated by my own culture. It is important for minority staff to have a personal sense of comfort, ease and a sense of validation due to ARE. As a teacher in this Board for 16 years, it is the first time I'm comfortable to say I'm Jewish and feel comfortable talking about it with kids." (A teacher)

   These comments were confirmed by the teachers' self-reporting in the 1995 survey. Three quarters of the teachers (75%) indicated that they are well prepared to deal with incidents of overt racism between students (e.g., name-callings, fights). In addition, a large majority (83%) of them agreed that they were "well prepared to integrate anti-racist education into their teaching." The latter represents quite a substantial increase from 61% in 1991. (See Table 3.)

2. Teachers have changed from denying the existence of racism to acknowledging that it exists.

   "In the beginning of the implementation, there was a great deal of denial that the problem of racism even exists. Teachers tended to think it is somebody else's problem. Many of them took it as a personal attack. A lot of that has disappeared now." (A principal)

3. Teachers have increased in their level of awareness in ARE.

   "Teachers have gone through a lot of soul searching and self-questioning, it has been real growth for them. They have been trained differently. Their language has to be changed. They have to unlearn what they learned, to become aware of what they can say and can't say, and become more conscious of how we treat each other." (A principal)

   "In general, staff are slowly progressing and seem more attuned, i.e., more critical of racist content and more sensitive to the need for inclusive content." (A teacher-librarian)

4. Teachers have moved on from heightened awareness to taking action.

   "Teachers' attitudes have moved beyond sensitizing themselves and they are willing to change and actually take action." (A principal)

   "When a racial incident happened in November between two parents on the school premises, the immediate teacher reaction was: 'We won't

tolerate this in our school, we're not going to have this in our hallway, we're not going to allow our parents to do this.' The stand-up and take-action response was quite unanimous. I think that's the next step coming after the education part of it. People are now saying: 'We know it's wrong, we've had the education, now we're going to stand up and say its wrong and not tolerate it.'" (A principal)

It is interesting to note that some of the administrative and teaching staff mentioned that the practice of ARE at school has an extended influence on their own families and social lives. One principal gave an example of how she walked out of a car dealership when the car salesperson made a derogatory remark about the country in which a particular car was made.

"I gathered up my belongings and told him that I would not tolerate this thing and marched my family out the door. My teenager and husband were mortified by my reaction. My family knows that I will not tolerate this. They equally know that I will not just accept it. I couldn't turn around and walk out quietly and not say anything or do anything."

Another teacher also mentioned that because of the sensitization she received at work, she tended to carry it home to her family and friends.

"I have become much more aware of what my own kids say now. When they say: 'I got jibed!' I would say: 'What did you say about jibed? We can't say that any more.' When it comes to social life, I'm much more confident and comfortable coming out and saying it and letting people know how I feel or not allowing it and saying: 'I don't want to hear this'."

Teachers' expectations and treatment of students

Teachers' perceptions

The majority of teachers felt that they monitored themselves very closely to ensure that minority students in their class would not be marginalized. In the Year Four teacher survey (See Table 3), between 84% and 98% of the teachers indicated that they "often" or "very often":

- Organize classroom seating and student groups in ways that will not marginalize students from any racial groups (98%)
- Provide opportunities for students from all racial groups to take leadership roles in the class or in group work (94%)
- Provide opportunities for students from all racial groups to perform jobs with added responsibilities, e.g., reading to others (94%)
- Provide opportunities for students from all racial groups to be experts in different areas (84%).

There were few changes between Year One and Year Four results. This could be due to the fact that the percentages were already high in Year One.

Parents' perceptions

In the Year Four survey, parents were asked to give their impressions of teachers' treatment and expectations of their children at school. (See Table 2.) Over three-quarters of White, Asian and Black parents agreed that:

- Their children were encouraged by teachers in the school to learn to the best of their abilities (81%)
- Teachers had high expectations for all students regardless of race and gender in the school (78%)
- Their children were treated fairly by adults in school (77%)
- Their children received appropriate recognition for their achievements (76%).

Some of the parents elaborated on what they thought about this topic in the interviews.

> *"Teachers have changed in the way they treat minority students compared to the time when my older kids were in elementary school. Teachers, in general, have become more aware of their own biases and monitor themselves a bit more. They are quite sensitive to the different backgrounds of students nowadays. They are making great efforts in teaching students who do not speak English as their first language."* *(A Black parent)*

> *"The teaching staff have come a long way. When my kids first came from Trinidad, their French was behind, so they were getting C's and D's, but teachers have made good efforts in helping my kids improve their French, so later my kids caught up and are getting A's now. I think teachers are quite knowledgeable about the cultures of their students."* *(A Black parent)*

However, some parents also pointed out that a handful of teachers could improve in their treatment of students and in their awareness of the needs and potential of immigrant students. For example:

> One Spanish-speaking parent felt that: *"Some teachers are not patient enough with new immigrant kids who don't speak the English language. Sometimes children feel frustrated and cry when they cannot learn the language fast enough."*

> Another immigrant parent gave an example that illustrates the lack of sensitivity shown by a supply teacher: *"The teacher insisted that my child's name sounds more Russian than Turkish and commented about what a "proper" Turkish name sounds like. My child was quite upset by it. To me, making comments about a child's name is quite insensitive."*

> The same parent also said: *"Some teachers fail to see the potential of the kids and judge them by their English language skills, which is quite superficial. They get impatient when kids don't get it immediately the first time. The kids should be given special attention because some of these students come from rural communities and do not have formal schooling experiences in their home country. Teachers should be sent to some of these villages as part of their training."*

One Black parent commented that: *"There is still a small number of teachers who do not have high expectations for all kids or do not treat kids equally, because I have seen minority kids of high abilities not reaching their potential."*

These parents were concerned about the teachers' unintended bias towards their children. They also feared that teachers' misinterpretations of ESL children as "unresponsive" or "slow learners" might trigger "negative teacher attitudes towards these children ... thus affecting teacher expectations, which in turn affects pupil performance." (Corson, 1994, p.10.)

Students' perceptions

When students were asked whether they were treated fairly by adults at school, more than half (58%) of the students indicated "yes" in the Year Four survey. Interestingly, Asian students (64%) tended to feel this way more than White (58%), Black (50%) and Latin American students (51%). (See Table 4.)

When students were asked whether they get as many chances as other kids to do special jobs for their teacher in class, the majority of them (63%) agreed. Again Asian students (71%) were more likely to agree with this statement than students of other races (55%-63%). (See Table 4.)

Two students during their interviews gave examples of unfair treatment of supply teachers on gender issues. One of the students mentioned about the supply teacher *"asking the girls to do special things."* The second student said: *"I don't think it's a race thing, it's a sex thing. If you are a certain sex, the teacher will like you better. Sometimes they try to make it equal, sometimes they don't. They try to separate the guys from the girls. Some teachers still believe that girls should be home cooking and wiping."*

A third student who was very much aware of the stereotypes that Black males are subjected to in society at large confirmed that teachers in his school were not racist, compared to the teachers in his brother's school (not in Wards 11/12). He described his brother's school this way: *"The teachers there act like racists. My brother gets a D and teachers pay less attention to him because they think it's the Blacks who are doing all the bad things, who never come to school and carry guns and knives. But none of these racist things happen in this school."*

On the topic of teachers' expectations, students in the interviews reported that the race of the students generally does not bias teachers' expectations. One student said: *"It doesn't matter who you are, if you have trouble doing spelling, then she expects you to work harder."* In terms of teacher fairness in giving out punishment and praises, students thought that race has nothing to do with this. One student said: *"Teachers here give you what you deserve."*

Principal' perceptions

When principals and vice-principals were asked about teachers' expectations, they tended to agree that teachers have high expectations for all students.

One principal confirmed that: *"Teachers generally have higher standards now than before. I try to instill in teachers the philosophy: 'Aim high and what you will get is a bonus'."*

Her vice-principal also agreed that: *"Teachers try to involve the disadvantaged groups to do their best in the area of the academics. They encourage the students by saying: 'You can be any thing that you want to be.' Although it does not always come out that way, the expectation of aiming high is there."*

In terms of teacher treatment, one vice-principal felt that: *"My staff have been good and positive and I haven't come across any teacher who isn't interested in the anti-racist type of activities. I haven't had kids complaining to me that I am being picked on by teachers because I am of another race or colour."*

Students' awareness and willingness to take social action

Level of awareness

Principals noticed that students in their schools have become very conscious of racial issues, and that racial minority students, in particular, have become more aware of their own rights.

> *"Students have become very conscious of racial incidents, and more are able to detect and label them as racist due to their awareness."* (A principal)

> *"The children at this school are at the level of awareness of what is tolerated and what is not tolerated ... and they make complaints. The terminology and the language the children are using reflect the anti-racist philosophy of the school. When they come into the office they will state 'so and so made a racist comment or we were denied this because of our race.' ... What I find to be a change over the last few years is the level of understanding, the level of sophistication in the language that kids are now using to make their statements, to make their complaints, to seek equity related to whatever it is that they are after."* (A principal)

Another kind of sensitivity that students have developed was mentioned by one teacher-librarian who found that: *"Some students have developed an awareness of racial stereotyping in the literature which requires effective critical analysis, and a certain amount of sophistication on the part of the student."*

Willingness to speak up and take action

While it is important for students to be aware of racism, it is also important for them to learn how to fight racism by speaking up and taking action. There is concrete evidence that students in Wards 11/12 are willing to break the silence, come forward and show their disapproval of racism. The following quotes and examples from the Year Four interviews illustrate how students responded to racial incidents and racist language at school, at home and in the neighbourhood.

At school

"My kids in this school are coming to me and saying: 'We will not tolerate this (a racial incident that broke out between parents in the school), we will not put up with this, this is wrong'." (A principal)

Another example that happened at the school level was an incident that involved students who were members of C.A.R.S. (Club Against Racism and Sexism). They spoke up against the sales of magazines to students that contained racist and sexist messages in a fund-raising campaign.

At home

A principal mentioned that some students are educating their parents about racist language. *"There are some kids now who are saying to their parents: 'You can't say that'."* Some students in the interviews confirmed what the principal said. They indicated that they are ready to deal with racism involving family members or friends. One student said: *"If someone at home says something racist, I'll probably be mad and then I'll talk about it and say anybody could be friends, it doesn't matter to what culture group they belong. If my mom and dad say that, I'll say: 'Oh have a heart! Don't you care about other people's feelings'."*

In the neighborhood

A vice-principal stated that some senior students in her school were quite proactive in trying to ease the racial confrontations between students in their school and the neighbouring Separate school. She recalled: *"These were students in our student council who reached out and invited the Separate school students to attend our school's special functions, one example of which was the December 6th Anti-Violence Against Women event, during which the student council members made presentations."*

Two other examples again involved students from C.A.R.S.. In one instance, these students organized a boycott against a local variety store because the proprietor refused to serve students from certain racial minority groups. The C.A.R.S. students subsequently obtained an apology from the store owner.

In the other instance, the C.A.R.S. students organized a protest against some workers in the local businesses who made sexist comments to senior students passing by on their way to school. In addition, the C.A.R.S. students wrote a letter to the employers to ensure that their employees were aware of the offensive nature of their sexist remarks.

In the larger community

However, students appear to be less ready to speak up and take social action in the larger community beyond their neigbourhood. For example, when Grades 6-7 students were asked in the interviews whether or not they would be prepared to write to the media on issues related to social inequities or overt racism and stereotyping, they said they felt too powerless to do anything.

> Their answers were: *"The media probably wouldn't listen to kids." "The editors don't care because they are making money from newspapers and stuff."*

Students at the lower grades appeared to be less ready to enter into the social action stage than the older students. A principal of a junior school explained that: *"A lot of our children are still at the very concrete stage. They are not able to translate a lot of what they hear into real action. Teachers have to help them to translate into action."*

Students' self-esteem

Students' perceptions

On the Year Four student survey, students were asked a number of questions that indirectly measured their self-image. (See Table 4.) The overall results[13] show that children of the different racial groups tend to think positively about themselves:

- They are happy being who they are (92%)
- They are happy with the way they look (86%)
- They think they can do as well as other kids in school if they want to (86%).

Teachers' perceptions

Various teacher-librarians observed some changes in the self-esteem of minority students as a result of the display and reading materials in school that reflected the students' ethnic and cultural roots. Some teacher-librarians linked the enhanced self-image of students to an increased sense of belonging to school, a heightened level of comfort in speaking up in class and a rising interest in reading.

> A teacher-librarian noticed how students feel validated and proud of their backgrounds when they see displays of different festivals highlighted at various times of the year: Diwali, Festival of Lights, spring festivals (e.g., the Turkish spring new year) or the Hanukkah theme table displayed side by side with the Christmas and Kwanza tables. She said: *"It is evident in their eyes -- especially when they see the theme tables. The kids feel validated".*
>
> Another teacher-librarian said: *"ARE materials affect the kid's self-esteem positively. Definitely, kids seem to feel they belong more because of an increased sense of identity through English and other language books. The library is not viewed as a foreign place since students can find materials that they can relate to. I noticed that the Vietnamese folk tales (in English) are used by kids quite frequently. As a result, kids are more willing to share their own experience in class, e.g., a Vietnamese child who escaped by boat and was later attacked by pirates was willing to talk about his experience in class."*
>
> A third teacher-librarian sensed that students are interested in reading and seeing themselves in a book. She recalled when she watched Black children listen to a story about Blacks: *"Their faces reflect an enthusiasm and 'a little twinkle'. It reaffirms them (it is hard to define), and they'll often get up and want to take a second look at the book."*

---

13. The first two items, which were also asked in Year One, remained consistently high across the racial groups over time. The third item was only asked in the Year Four survey, hence no comparison can be made over time.

Principals' perceptions

One principal also observed some noticeable changes in the self-confidence of students in Special Education. She said: *"We have a number of children who will go off to Learning Centre or LD who are getting very self-confident. A lot of them are willing to do extra work and have quite a positive attitude to our school, which means that we might not be looking at children who, down the road, will be dropouts."*

However, not all principals felt that ARE has a positive impact on the self-esteem of minority children, especially their academic self-esteem. One principal commented that: *"It is very difficult to say whether the self-esteem of racial minority students has improved. Though we try very hard to help them, there are still some minority students who are not highly successful in school, who feel disadvantaged and feel that they are not treated fairly."*

Parents' perceptions

When parents were asked whether ARE had helped their children to feel better about their cultural/racial backgrounds, 50% agreed. (See Table 2.) Interestingly, among those who agreed, there was proportionately more Asian (71%) than White (37%) and Black parents (54%). It is not clear from the data why this wide disparity of opinions existed.

It appears that parents have different expectations for ARE. For example, a Black parent commented that he does not expect the school ARE initiatives to have much influence on his child's self-esteem. His explanation was: *"I think parents have more influence on their children than teachers in this area. I am not counting on teachers to boost the self-esteem of my child. I think their effort in this area is minimal on my child."*

On the other hand, another Black parent felt that her son's school had helped him to develop a positive self-image and pride about his race[14]: *"Alex, now six, already understands that difference is not a negative thing. He recognizes his skin as darker than most in his class, but he understands race as just one of a number of variables, like language or religion. For Alex difference is something to celebrate. I think school deserves much of the credit for his positive attitude."*

Students' school achievement

Because of the lack of direct measures on student achievement[15] (e.g., English and Mathematics performance over time), indirect indicators have been used instead. They include:

- o tracking the types and frequency of school awards received by students by race between Year One and Year Four;

---

14. This is a quote from Donna Nurse, a Ward 11/12 parent, who wrote about her experience in the November, 1994 issue of CITY Parent, p.8.

15. In Year One, the Benchmarks were just developed and teachers were not yet familiar with the application, and have not used them on a consistent basis across the schools. Moreover, there was no common record of progress for students across the schools to measure student achievement.

- examining subsequent program placement of students in secondary schools by race in the base year (1991-92) and in a later period (1996-97);[16]
- asking staff for their perceptions about the students' level of interest in reading; and
- asking parents for their opinions on whether ARE has affected their children's school performance.

Changes in the amount and types of school awards received by students of different racial backgrounds

The tracking of the frequency and types of awards received by students shows that Black students who were underrepresented in the share of academic and music/art awards have made steady gains between Year One and Year Four. Their share of academic awards has increased from 13% to 22%, and music/art awards from 15% to 33%, while their representation in the school population was stable (18% and 19%) in the corresponding years. (See Cheng, 1996b for further details.)

However, the results also indicate that the underrepresentation of Asian students in sports and music/art awards remained constant. For example, while they made up 26%-27% of the school population, their share of sports and music/art awards was still 14% and 19%, respectively, in Year Four.

In general, the representation of White award recipients reflects quite well the proportion of Whites in the school population, except for a few anomalies (e.g., Year Four of the academic awards, and Year Two of the sports awards.) Further monitoring of trends over a longer period of time is needed to establish clearer patterns.

Finally, greater gender equities have been achieved in specific areas of excellence. For example, more males have received academic and music/art awards, while more females have acquired sports awards in the last few years. Consequently, a more balanced gender distribution was achieved by Year Four. (See Cheng, 1996b for further details.)

Changes in secondary school program placement for students of different racial backgrounds

The secondary school program placement of students from the Wards 11/12 feeder schools in 1991-92 shows that the percent distributions of students in the various programs differed according to race. For example, while 71% of all Grade 9 students were enrolled in Advanced programs, the percent of students in this type of programs for Blacks, Whites and Asians were 53%, 75% and 82%, respectively.

The subsequent cohorts of secondary students who come from the Wards 11/12 feeder schools will be examined in terms of the proportions who enrol in Advanced, General and Basic programs by race in 1996-97, the year when the next Every Secondary Student Survey will be conducted.[17] The purpose is to determine if the proportions of students who enrol in Advanced programs across all racial groups have changed over time and whether the disparities among the racial groups have lessened. It is expected that the younger cohorts in

16. The reason for choosing these two time periods is because they coincide with the Every Secondary School Student Surveys which enable us to link student program placement information to their race for several cohorts of secondary students.

17. Because of the Provincial destreaming of Grade 9 students in recent years, only program placements of students in Grades 10 and higher will be examined.

secondary school who have had the longer exposure to ARE in the Wards 11/12 feeder schools would show fewer racial disparities in the program enrolment patterns, compared to the older cohorts who were already at the end of elementary school when ARE was introduced to Wards 11/12. A follow-up report will be prepared when the 1996-97 Every Secondary Student Survey data become available.

Staff perceptions of the student level of interest in reading

Some staff linked an increased level of interest in reading to ARE this way:

> A teacher-librarian mentioned that: *"Inclusive materials have helped to promote reading interest, especially for reluctant ESL readers. The Reading Buddy program has also made a difference for some."*
>
> A second teacher mentioned: *"I observed that ESL students particularly enjoy books about themselves, stories about their own culture and dual language materials. When their peers find out that those books are interesting, they want to read them too, so there is that domino effect on other students as well."*
>
> One principal who, after commenting on the increase of anti-racist materials in her school, said: *"Children are reading and they're reading a lot of books. When you go into the classrooms, you'll see children sitting down quietly, working and striving to do well. For the most part, I think the implementation of ARE has been successful."*

Parents' perceptions on the relationship between ARE and student achievement

Interestingly, there appears to be little consensus among parents on whether ARE helps the academic achievement of students. During the Year Four survey, when parents were asked whether ARE had helped their children to improve in their school achievement, less than half (44%) agreed. (See Table 2.) There were substantial differences among racial groups on this issue. For example, White (28%) and Black (32%) parents were much more skeptical about the impact of ARE on the academic achievement of their children than Asian (70%) parents who seemed to be quite convinced about the academic benefits of ARE.

The following are examples of how differently two Black parents felt about the impact of ARE on student academic achievement. One Black parent said: *"My kids are proud of who they are, and ARE has helped them do well in school and have good report cards from the teachers. They do well with the computer. They also play music: French horn, recorder, violin as well as take part in the steel band."* The other Black parent, however, expressed a different viewpoint: *"In terms of the impact of ARE on my children's achievement, parental involvement and the children's own efforts are more important than ARE."*

Special Education program placement

General awareness of school staff about the need to monitor their practices

The principals in Wards 11/12 schools indicated that they have become more aware of the need to monitor their own practices in identifying and placing students of different racial/ethnic groups in Special Education programs.

One principal said: *"I will admit to you that I have become very conscious of any disparity in terms of schooling outcomes by racial/ethnic groups. I am constantly asking myself now: 'Are we identifying a particular cultural/ethnic group more than another in whatever area it may be? Do we have a situation where we have children from a certain ethnic/cultural group being referred more frequently to the local school team or IPRC for gifted and other special needs programs? I have initiated conversations with Black parents whose children are going through identification or IPRCs for Special Education programs. I regularly talk with parents of different ethnic groups. I think it is something that continually needs work, and requires awareness."*

Gifted program

One of the greatest changes that took place in this Family of schools was the growth in the number of students identified as Gifted. Between Year One and Year Four of the study, the Gifted Program enrolment has risen from 53 to 102 for students of all racial groups.

Although the Gifted program enrolment pattern has not totally mirrored the population make-up in Wards 11/12 schools by Year Four, the gap has narrowed for some groups. For example, the Black male students who were substantially underrepresented in the Gifted Program in Year One have increased their representation from 4% to 11% in Year Four. While the percent of Black males in the Gifted program (11%) was still lower than the percent of Blacks in the overall male student population (18%), the extent of the underrepresentation has lessened over time. (For more details, please see Cheng, 1996a.)

Other Special Education programs

No systematic data are available at two time points to monitor the changes in other types of Special Education program placements (e.g., Learning Disabled, Behavioural) in the Wards 11/12 schools. However, a few staff mentioned that attempts have been made to offer more remedial help to students in regular classes instead of placing them in Special Education programs.

A principal commented: *"We are taking fewer kids to IPRC now. Teachers are programming more in the classrooms to help meet the needs of kids. There was a time when the first thing teachers thought of when kids were not doing well in school was to get them into Special Education programs. I am not seeing too much of that now. Teachers are trying very hard to have remedial programs for them in the classrooms."*

Racial composition of school staff

A comparison of the racial composition of principals and vice-principals between 1990-91 and 1994-95 shows that the proportion of racial minorities in these positions has increased from 9% to 19% in the Wards 11/12 schools. (See Table 6.) Although 19% is still lower than the proportion of racial minority students in the school population, the change has helped to lessen the gap.

No teacher demographic data were available for both Year One and Year Four to document the change over time for this family of schools. However, most principals and vice-principals admitted that they have not been too successful in changing the staff composition in their schools to reflect the student population. This, they explained, is not due to a lack of effort.

One reason is that the teaching staff has remained very static so that few new teachers are hired and the other reason is that there are not enough minority candidates in the applicant pool.

> *"Most staff members have been here twenty-five, fifteen years and they are not moving. At present we have one staff member representing a minority group and nothing else. Everyone else is Caucasian. I would really like to see a better representation of the population out there."*

Another principal echoed a similar situation: *"Because there has not been a large turnover of staff in the school, there is not a great deal of opportunity to change the staff composition. But it is very much on our minds. We tried very hard, but racial minority candidates are not in the applicant pool. We believe minority students need to see role models, we are very much aware of it. We agree it is a problem. We make it a priority to hire minority staff. We have been begging, courting, twisting arms and waiting for phone calls, because we think it is important."*

A third vice-principal agreed: *"When we talk about equity, our staff should reflect the groups our students represent. We certainly make the effort to recruit racial/ethnic minorities. However, when we have the openings, we don't always have the kind of people we need to make it a reality."*

There was only one school in Wards 11/12 which seemed to be an exception. This school experienced a tremendous change (a 70% change) in the staff makeup. The principal explained: *"I have brought in new blood from both the mainstream and ethnic minority groups. These are people who have enough empathy and enough drive to make a difference."*

School climate

Data from various sources confirmed that the school climate has improved as indicated by the extent of intercultural friendships and the decline of racial incidents in the Wards 11/12 schools.

Intercultural, interracial friendships

The majority of students self-reported that they play with friends of different races (83% in 1991 and 88% in 1995) in school.[18] This finding is confirmed by the teacher observation data. In the Spring of 1992, 20 teachers across four schools tracked the interactions of their students at lunch/recess times over four days of observation.[19] It was found that the majority (70%) of the 428 students observed interacted with peers of a different race compared to only 17% who interacted with peers of the same race. Among the cross-racial interactions, 92% of the interactions were friendly or positive involving such activities as playing games/sports or talking.

Such feelings were reinforced in the interviews with the various groups. Some quotes from students, parents, teachers and principals include:

---

18. And the majority of students also felt they fit in at school (77% in 1991 and 83% in 1995). (See Tables 4 and 5.)

19. Teachers were asked to record if a student from their class was interacting with children of the same race, with children from a different race(s), or alone; and whether the interactions were positive or negative.

"I have friends who are Jamaican. Some are Canadian Indian like me and they are all just different." (A student)

"I hang out with lots of friends from different cultural and racial groups and I hang out with my race too." (A student)

The students realized the importance of having friends of diverse backgrounds in terms of the knowledge they gain about other cultures, which would help them in their future jobs.

"For myself, I enjoy coming to school with different cultures because we learn about different cultures. I personally learn from my friends different things and they learn from me too. It would be useful to know other cultures in terms of your future jobs because companies like to hire people who are bilingual and want to go to different places, so you need to have a little bit of knowledge about where you're going."

"I think it's useful to be in a school with students from different racial groups, because when you grow up, and when you go out to work, in a work place you will see a mixed racial background as well."

One vice-principal also agreed that the intercultural friendships extend beyond the school yard into the community.

She said: *"Once a Black girl in a workshop confirmed: 'O yes, we (she and girls of different racial groups from the class) are friends outside of school, we do visit each other's houses. In this school, we are taught how to get along with each other and we don't call each other names. This is a wonderful place for kids to learn that, because we are so multiracial in the school.'"*

When parents were asked in the survey about their perceptions of students' peer relationships, 67% of them[20] agreed that: "There is co-operation and respect among students of different ethnic/racial groups in school." Parents confirmed in the interviews that students of diverse backgrounds are indeed mixing.

"I am glad to see kids of different races and language backgrounds (Spanish speaking, Black, Vietnamese, Indian) getting along so well. They play basketball together, talk and walk together in the school yard and after school. They go to the corner stores and restaurants together. There is little segregation by cultural groups (such as Blacks with Blacks, Chinese with Chinese) in the school." (A Black parent)

"There is a sense of brotherhood among students in the school because the staff teach kids to respect each other." (A Spanish-speaking parent)

The mixing of students seems to go deeper than just playing together. One teacher gave an example of how students actually made the experience of other cultures part of their own:

"My personal experience of hearing non-Jewish kids spontaneously break into song "Hannukah, oh Hannukah ... really touched me. It was a very interesting moment that I'll carry for many years. To me, this is evidence that ARE is working."

---

20. Asian parents (73%) tended to have the highest proportion who agreed with this item.

Some students mentioned that although there are cliques in the school, they were formed not according to racial ethnic differences: *"There are groups, but not racial groups in the school. They group together because they have similar interests, not because they are of the same race. When we have groups, we don't really care what our background is, and we don't care about our religion and that stuff."*

Racial incidents

Many indicators have been used to measure the extent of racial incidents in Wards 11/12 schools over the four-year period, and they all seem to point to the fact that the incidents have decreased and that the school climate has moved closer to a racial harassment-free environment. (See Cheng, 1996c for more details on this topic.) For example:

- The percent of students who indicated that they have been called racist names in school within the year has decreased from 40% in 1991-92 to 25% in 1994-95;
- The percent of students who have seen kids push, hit or throw things at other kids because they are from a different race has decreased from 28% in 1991-92 to 23% in 1994-95; and
- The percent of students who found the principals and vice-principals taking racist name calling seriously has gone up from 71% in 1991-92 to 81% in 1994-95.

According to the principals' own recording of racial incidents, the extent of incidents declined from a rate of 4.2 per 100 students in 1991 to 2.2 in 1995. (See Cheng, 1996c for more details.)

Parental involvement

The majority of parents, regardless of their racial backgrounds, tended to agree in the 1995 survey that the schools in Wards 11/12 have succeeded in making the school climate welcoming for them to visit, to talk to staff and to participate in school events. For example, over 70% of White and racial minority parents agreed that:

- They feel welcome to call or visit any time at their child's school
- The school provides many occasions when parents can talk to teachers
- They feel free to contact the teachers or principal with concerns
- The school makes it easy for parents of different racial/ethnic backgrounds to take part in all school activities (e.g., by providing interpreters, scheduling meetings at times convenient to parents).

However, despite the feelings of welcome indicated on the survey, data from other sources (i.e., parent survey, principal interviews and the tracking of parental contacts by school staff) show that minority parents were not as active as White parents in many types of parental involvement. In addition, they did not initiate contacts with school authorities as often as White parents. The data reveal that the low participation of racial minority parents was not due to the lack of effort on the part of school staff, but mostly due to parents' work and other commitments. (See Cheng, 1996d for more details on this topic.)

The tracking of parental contacts by school staff also indicates that there were some variations in the nature of home-school contacts by racial-linguistic groups. For example:

- Compared to other racial/linguistic groups, White parents who are not English speakers (e.g., Portuguese, Italian, Greek) tend to have more problem-oriented contacts with *principals* about their children's school attendance than other racial-linguistic sub-groups in the first two years of the study. However, such differences disappeared in the last year of the study.

- Black parents tend to see *teachers* more often than White and Asian parents about their children's behavioural problems in school in all three years of the data collection, and such differences have not reduced over time.

On the other hand, the majority of both White and racial minority parents agreed that the contacts they had with the school staff were positive (even when the contacts involved discussing problems about their children), because of the professionalism demonstrated by the school staff and also because of their supportive, caring attitudes. (See Cheng, 1996d for more details on this topic.)

Suggestions for future implementation

Over 40% of teachers in the 1995 survey (See Table 3) suggested that they need to be trained in the following areas in ARE:

1. To turn student awareness and knowledge of racism into social action (54%)
2. Practical suggestions on ARE classroom techniques (47%)
3. Information on dealing with sensitive/awkward situations (45%)
4. Suggestions on integrating anti-racism into specific curriculum areas (45%).

In the teacher interviews, similar or additional ideas on how to improve future implementation of ARE were mentioned. These include the need to:

1. Give the teachers more curriculum resources or more practical guidelines on how to integrate ARE into the subject areas, e.g., teachers who have a background related to integration can be invited to share their experience:

   "In some classrooms, the integration of ARE is being done incidentally rather than purposefully ... It would really be helpful for teachers if curriculum guidelines were clearly outlined, and included suggestions on how to use ARE in the different areas, i.e., science, geography, history, or if resources were specified to back up ARE."

2. Raise the awareness of teachers about the more recent immigrant groups, e.g., invite speakers to talk about the Turkish culture and celebrations.
3. Raise the awareness of teachers about events which have not been widely publicized, e.g., few teachers know about the Asian Heritage Week which is relatively new.
4. Explore the racial relationships and dynamics among more diverse groups, e.g., Vietnamese and Whites or Blacks and Chinese because the available resources so far tend to concentrate mostly on the Blacks and Whites.
5. Organize informal cultural awareness sessions at lunch or other free times for teachers and students:

   "Some teachers aren't 'on board' due to personal upbringing. If we had more speakers explaining or enlightening, it would be an asset, e.g., a Jewish teacher can raise awareness of the Jewish culture in other teachers. It could occur informally, in teacher-teacher, teacher-child interactions in the lunch room, etc."

6. Organize an "Anti-Racist Book Fair" with different companies represented to expose teachers to relevant materials, e.g., items on mathematics from different cultures.
7. Remind teachers to keep a balance in validating the cultural backgrounds of students from both the dominant and minority groups:

   "While teachers must provide equity to racial, ethnic minority students, e.g., give colouring assignment of Star of David (a religious symbol), we must not forget our English/Caucasian validation. It is important to keep a balance."

Factors that facilitated or hindered the implementation of ARE

Several factors that facilitated or impeded the implementation of ARE were uncovered during the interviews with various principals and teachers. Factors that facilitated ARE include:

Leadership at the system level

A few staff mentioned that the thrust on racial, ethnocultural equity at the Board level has helped to facilitate the implementation of ARE in the Wards 11/12 schools.

> *"The Board policies and directives on equity are really important. They are there for everyone to know what the Board's bottom line is. People have to be told what the expectations are. I think there also has to be strong messages and expectations from the administration. I think people have to know that certain things are not negotiable and you have to do them. It's the 1990s, things have changed and we have to be part of that change. (A principal)*

The School Superintendent

Various groups of school staff (principals, vice-principals, classroom teachers and teacher-librarians) have mentioned that the leadership and support of their School Superintendent,[21] has been the driving force behind the program implementation. Their comments include:

> *"In all honesty, the School Superintendent has led us to all the positive changes we have seen so far. It has to have been the intense ARE thrust that has been placed on Wards 11 and 12 led by him." (A principal)*

> *"There are positive changes in anti-racism in our Ward under the leadership of our Superintendent. When you go outside the Ward, you don't see the same emphasis. Unless they have someone that pushes ARE, it just doesn't get done." (A principal)*

> *"Primarily there was the support from the Superintendent both for being here as well as financial support in terms of paying for workshops, equipment, books, etc. The change-over in the library has been quite dramatic in the last five years." (A principal)*

> *"The ARE workshops that the Superintendent held for librarians have helped tremendously. The exposure to different speakers, a variety of activities and different materials has helped to make teacher-librarians curriculum leaders in the schools. The workshops surrounding ARE (generally) make you more aware of the problems that exist and give you ideas, solutions and suggestions re: what materials to buy, to look for and to weed. The librarians want to come back to the school and promote ARE to the staff." (A teacher-librarian)*

> *"The Superintendent has been good about getting us the budget for the anti-racist materials in the last few years. Over the years, teachers have accumulated a good collection of materials that they can now use." (A teacher)*

---

21. The School Superintendent who initiated the study has been promoted to another position at the time when this report was prepared.

School principals and vice-principals

A number of principals and vice-principals emphasized their own roles in bringing about the changes outlined in their ARE local school plans. The roles mentioned include: setting goals, reminding the school community about the goals, providing support to staff, being a role model, maintaining a strong conviction and showing an appreciation for the efforts of their staff.

> *"The most important factor for positive change and action is: Principal! Principal! Principal! While it is important to have a vision and set goals, the key is someone who makes it happen. A school administrator needs to be sensitive to the needs of the community and staff and to have a seventh sense: to give help always ... they need to know you will shoulder them. A principal is also a teacher, a role model. The principal has to be on top of things and project a confidence. It is very important to recognize teachers for their extra efforts."*

> *"The conviction of the principal is important. Thinking back it was my decision to put anti-racist education on every single staff meeting agenda, that was my decision. The importance that I placed on it is part of the school life."*

> *"The leadership of the principal is very important. In my case, I play a strong leadership role in terms of reminding people about ARE."*

> *"It is the duty of the administrator to keep the momentum alive and to continue to keep the teachers aware of the issue of racism."*

> *"The administrators have been making most of these things happen. We want to make sure that we have the resources there for staff, even if it means going to the city or putting in a proposal to the Arts Council to get people to come in, so that is our end of it."*

> *"Administration spearheaded the changes. We went out of our way to make people feel comfortable and held meetings regularly with office staff to talk about our approach to the public. We also talked to the teaching staff about what we expected of them and the kids, and what we wanted this place to be like. We instilled in the kids that all adults who work in here are responsible for them and ought to be respected. We made it a point of duty to do everything to have everybody working together, so that the common goal of ARE can be accomplished."*

Classroom teachers and teacher-librarians

It is quite obvious in the data that the classroom teachers and teacher-librarians have played a key role in bringing about the changes presented in this report. The ways these teachers facilitated the changes are summarized below:

> *"For ARE to succeed, it is essential to get teachers on board (which took 1 1/2 years to do at this school). Implementation of ARE is seen as a challenge for staff, but most embrace it. The key is to start with teachers who will make a difference, like a contagion, it spreads. Teachers must be both planners and facilitators of the ARE initiative." (A principal)*

"While the classroom teacher's role in this school is to raise ARE awareness through literature, the teacher-librarian can help and talk to kids on an individual level to raise awareness, e.g., by pointing out stereotypes when helping a student to locate materials." (A teacher-librarian)

"The library more often initiates, but it is a two-way process. There is also a core group of classroom teachers who are fully committed to ARE. They bring together their ideas and share their expertise with us, e.g., exchange lists. During the exchange, we realize that ARE is not just an issue of Black and White, they want to include themes such as the Holocaust and Hiroshima -- a more multiethnic focus. We have to see people, not just materials, as resources. An ongoing exchange of information is key." (A teacher-librarian)

"The teacher-librarians have to be attuned to the needs of schools/communities (the mark of a good library); we need to read through books (especially pictures) and look for depictions of the variety of cultures represented at the school. We have to make a conscious effort to choose quality materials that represent the student population. For authenticity, we have to look into obtaining the works of ethnic authors." (A teacher-librarian).

ARE reps

A few of the principals and vice-principals mentioned that their ARE school reps[22], who attended meetings and training sessions at the Board and/or Ward, have helped their schools to facilitate the implementation of ARE.

"Our school ARE rep is very diligent in bringing wonderful ideas and materials to the attention of our staff and encouraging them to try out new things." (A principal)

"One good thing about our staff is that we are always analyzing what is working and not working in our ARE plans, what we should carry over for next year, what new things to add and what we should do away with. Staff who are on the Wards 11/12 ARE Steering Committee always come back from the committee with information and ideas and share them with the rest of the staff. The reps are the ears of the staff. They know their needs. They always come back with ideas to help us in assessing our ARE plans." (A vice-principal)

Other factors

The Community Relations Office and the School Community Advisors have been mentioned by principals and staff as instrumental in building links with the community. This is another important component of ARE. One principal also recognized the role played by the community itself: *"Again, I bring in the community too, I think our parents are becoming more sophisticated and when that happens in a community, I think it smartens up the school personnel. They recognize that if students feel better about themselves, staff will feel better and that people are performing to the best of their ability. Then it will be a happier climate and there will be fewer problems."*

During the interviews, school administrators also identified four major factors that they felt impeded the implementation of ARE:

---

22. Most of the school reps are teachers who are interested in equity issues.

Staff resistance

Most of the principals or vice-principals indicated that although the schools have made great strides in teachers' attitudes towards ARE, there is still a small segment of teachers who resist or pay only lip service to the idea of ARE. The reasons given are:

- Teachers do not have commitment to ARE

  "Some teachers will only do the minimum of what they have to do because at heart they don't personally believe in it. For example, some teachers go through the motions of the Black History Month to get it over with."

- Teachers do not think racism is a problem

  "There is the odd teacher who thinks it is an OK world, but we are talking about a small number."

  "A few of the staff, are still in the mode that 'if I don't talk about it, it will go away' or 'we don't have to talk about it because we don't have the problems.'"

- Teachers feel that undue attention is given to racial/ethnic minorities

  "It was that inability to move cut of your own little corner that prompted a couple of teachers to say: 'So why all this talk about Blacks, I've got a heritage too, why aren't we talking about my heritage too?' It was that inability to move out of your own little corner which blocks the implementation of ARE."

  "A small number of staff resist ARE. They feel the focus is on minority groups only, leaving the mainstream out, with mainstream members feeling no sense of benefit, and, in some cases discrimination."

  "I wouldn't say the majority of staff resisted, but a small proportion did. It's because of who they are personally. Sometimes they feel threatened and perceive anti-racist education as a form of reverse discrimination and that's why they support ARE less enthusiastically than others."

  "The core group of teachers is supportive and receptive to the idea of incorporating ARE in the classrooms. But a few are set in their ways and have different feelings. Sometimes I hear not-very-tolerant comments which can filter down to kids. Some feel that ARE is backfiring and is becoming racist against the Whites (that is, reverse discrimination). If this continues, it may be difficult to keep some teachers on board."

  "Sometimes our staff feel that there is no need to hear more about ARE or have more workshops about the topic. We might have overkilled it."

- Teachers resist the extra work

  "A few of the staff are seeing ARE as a separate entity, not as a part of the curriculum. You'll still find a little resistance occasionally."

  "There are also some teachers who see every initiative from the board as separate with no connections, and they are overwhelmed by the large number of Board's initiatives."

"I guess one obstacle is that the Board brings down initiative after initiative after initiative and you can't meet them all. There is a system overload, aside from budgetary cuts and people feeling badly about that kind of stuff."

Lack of appropriate materials

The lack of suitable materials available in the market for the various grade levels and subject areas has been mentioned as an obstacle by a number of teachers. In addition, some pointed out that certain ethnic/cultural groups are not well represented in the materials.

"We don't have appropriate materials or picture books for primary education as far as environmental studies are concerned. When we talk about inventions as part of an inclusive curriculum, there are no such books or pictures, let alone tapes for little kids. How many picture books are there about Martin Luther King that kids have really taken into their own hands? We're told that such material has to be integrated. We talk about famous people who are racial minorities and their inventions, but there are no materials for the elementary level at all. They are absolutely missing, and they are the very core, the beginning of anti-racist education." (A teacher)

A music teacher commented that it is a challenge for her to integrate music with ARE and to get *"presenters, film strips or merely things that kids can study, so we can get students to see the differences". (A teacher)*

"How many kits does the Board have about Japan, India, Australia or any other country to bring into the classroom? That's not fair. The teachers don't have the time and money to acquire them. (A teacher)

"There is a lack of Asian characters taking a leading role. Chinese books are usually in Chinese or are translated into English stories that are not culturally authentic. While there is a circulation of materials, it is not enough. There are many Chinese folk tales and fairy tales but a lack of Chinese "everyday" stories, e.g., Jonathan and His Mommy. This may be because of the low demand. The ARE resources kit from ECRL (Education Center Reference Library) is excellent, but not too appropriate for the younger grades." (A teacher-librarian)

"There are not enough folk tales from various regions, especially Asian and Native Canadians for the different grade levels. There are not enough novel sets for Grades 7 and 8, although there are more for the junior grades." (A teacher-librarian)

Money

While some teachers and principals saw the lack of funds as a problem for ARE, others felt that it is not a big concern at this stage of the implementation.

One teacher commented that: *"The yearly budget is definitely not adequate. The library is allocated one portion of the whole school budget. Funds were redirected in the last few years and we had to provide rationale for our spending.* Another teacher agreed and said: *"Smaller schools are at a disadvantage as a result of budget constraints. They have to make hard choices."*

Several principals disagreed and did not worry about the impact of budget cuts.
"Some people will tell you that money is an obstacle, but I don't believe it. I think there are lots of things you can do without money. Instead, people are obstacles for me."

"We are well on our way. The School Superintendent has been good about getting us the budget for the anti-racist materials in the last few years. Over the years, teachers have accumulated a wealth of good materials that they can use and build on. When the money is tight and resources are scarce, we just have to work with what we have, improvise and make things happen."

"Many initiatives can continue at little or no cost. In this school, for example, many programs are already in place and money is not needed for start-up. I have high hopes about the success of ARE, eventually, especially as staff increasingly bring successes based on experience."

Parental resistance

A few principals and teachers reported that some parents are an obstacle in the work of ARE, but they were optimistic that the school could counter some of the negative influence from these homes.

"Some parents don't understand how far we've come and what we're trying to do with their kids in the area of ARE. Some of them set up road blocks in the way that they talk. I think we need to continue to do outreach with parents in terms of helping them not to be racist." (A teacher)

"Unfortunately, there are homes with prejudice where kids are being indoctrinated against other races. The role of the school is to instill a positive attitude: that all kids are equal regardless of colour or creed. Although we can't change what goes on in the home, we can influence the curriculum. The younger the child for whom we can raise awareness, the better." (A principal)

"Some parents in my school questioned me: 'Why does my child have to learn about ARE?' or 'Why is it necessary to celebrate holidays from other cultures?'." (A teacher)

Parental resistance is also apparent in some of the open-ended responses in the 1995 parent survey:

"At parent meetings, there are too many interpreters who are not needed. It's a total waste of money. I am also concerned about all the time and money being spent concerning ARE and question whether children at primary levels need such a focus on this subject. My child's school, which has 80% of its students belonging to groups other than 'mainstream' [or racial/ethnic minority backgrounds] might not need all the attention."

"I feel that not enough consideration is given to students who are not part of an ethnic/racial minority. I feel that these children are held back in order to teach multiculturalism, instead of teaching them more of the academic studies they will need in the future."

"Students are forced to learn Black history from Africa when the program for the year should be Canadian history from 1835 to 1915."

The future of ARE

The viability of ARE

When principals were asked to comment on the future of ARE[23], some of them thought it will continue regardless, because it has become so entrenched in the fabric of school life. Only a few were concerned that it would weaken, should there be a change in the administration at the Ward level. Most principals expressed optimism and faith in the strong foundation that the School Superintendent had laid. They had few doubts about the viability of ARE. The following quotations sum up the sentiments of most of the principals:

> *"ARE has become an everyday occurrence for teachers. It has become automatic and quite natural for teachers. I think ARE will continue. We can't go back to not doing it although we may use other means. We can't avoid dealing with the issue, given that we live in Toronto which is so multicultural. The Superintendent has given us a solid background and tremendous support that will carry us through even if he leaves."*

> *"The focus of anti-racist education in Wards 11 and 12 is certainly not going to go away. It is now a part of the fibre of the work we do. It represents the distance that we've come, it's not that we are going to stop, but I think that we'll continue independent of another Superintendent's direction, that's my personal view."*

> *"I'd like to think that the transfer of Superintendent would absolutely not kill the idea because ARE is too important to just put it on a shelf. I think if and when he goes, anti-racist education has a good foundation. Clearly his departure will not stop anti-racist education because I think now whatever comes we can always put it in the context of anti-racist education and make certain everyone gets whatever message we're supposed to deliver. That is the critical thing we have to be conscious of when we communicate to everyone."*

> *"Anti-racist education will continue. It had better! As long as I'm here, it's like my wooden floors -- don't you dare touch those as long as I'm here."*

The more cautious comments from a few of the principals include:

> *"If the Superintendent goes, I think ARE will die. It's sad to say that, unless if we get the staff that is really a reflection of the community out there. If we do not have administrators who are willing to go in that direction, I think ARE might die off. So it is all up to the administrators, even if you forget about a Superintendent who might be pushing it."*

> *"Frankly, I think if you have someone who is not really involved and keeping ARE up front all the time, it'll slip a little bit. Since we have new teachers coming in, I think if ARE is not being publicized all the time, it will slip a little bit. You really need administration at different levels making it crystal clear to*

---

23. The promotion of the School Superintendent to a Senior Superintendent position in the Central Office happened several months after the interviews with principals and vice-principals. Hence, the comments of the respondents were made without prior knowledge about the subsequent change of School Superintendent in Wards 11/12.

everyone that this is a very high priority because it's a priority that includes so many things."

The need to continue with ARE

School Superintendent

The School Superintendent who was interviewed at the end of the project reiterated that ARE should continue even though it has permeated every aspect of school life in the Wards 11/12 schools. *"It is important that the school staff not be complacent with their accomplishments, and keep the momentum going. There should be a renewal of commitment to ARE periodically, maybe at the beginning of each year when new students and new staff (teachers and administrators) come in. There is still a lot of work ahead of us. One example is: 'How do we make ARE part of the Board's other initiatives, such as ACFAS (A Curriculum for All Students)?'"*

Principals

One principal agreed that ARE needs to continue, but with a different format: *"We don't need to broadcast ARE everyday because it is now part of school and an accepted way of life. When it is working smoothly, we don't have to keep pounding on it. Staff and students are knowledgeable enough. There are certain do's and don't's and certain expectations that everybody is aware of and we do things fairly and equally. We can do away with reminding people about ARE."*

Another principal disagreed with the comment given by the above principal. She said: *"I think you still have to have a checklist sort of in the back of your mind, so that everything you do you can ask yourself: 'Now how does this fit equity? How does this fit anti-racist education?' ARE still has to be the school's goal or mission, it still has to be: 'Let us treat everyone as a human being.' So I don't see it as a job that will ever finish."*

Parents

One parent said: *"ARE should continue if we want a better country for the next generation. The country is becoming so multicultural and multiracial now, we need anti-racist education to keep the country together and prosperous."*

Another parent agreed: *"It must continue. We have no choice. The new and younger students should start to learn about ARE and the older students should continue to learn about this topic."*

One Vietnamese parent, who felt strongly that ARE should continue, said: *"The school should keep reminding people about ARE, keep advertising it and don't stop it."* Most White parents also agreed that it should continue because: *"It would be helpful to the new immigrant and refugee groups that recently arrived."*

Another parent commented that anti-bias work should be done at an early age: *"I find my teenagers resent being preached to re: socially 'correct' behaviour. School presentations on anti-bias themes just fall flat for them at this age. They seem to be at a stage where they are preoccupied with themselves and social interactions are paramount. If they learn about ARE at a young age, the payoff is a senior school where kids feel comfortable mixing with all backgrounds and friendships, and where all can get on the with the business of learning."*

Students

Most students also agreed that ARE should continue. One student, who was able to make conceptual links between the events of the Holocaust and other incidents of racism and social inequalities, explained: "*I think anti-racist education should continue, so that something like the Holocaust won't happen again.*" This similar concept was expressed by another student in a poem printed in the 1995 Education Week publication:

Remember

by Jeff Temporale

Grade 7

Essex P. S.

I imagine desperate people praying for their lives.
I see innocent Jewish families with terror in their eyes.
The smell of cremated bodies hangs frozen in the air.
I wonder where such hate begins.
Could one man really cause these sins?
Could this horror happen again?
Not as long as we remember them.

Limitations of the study

The biggest challenge for this kind of research is to measure the full impact of ARE within a short period of four years. As other practitioners of ARE research put it:

> *"The impact of anti-racist policies may, for example, take many years to materialize, perhaps appearing very well after students graduate from school ... Consequently, longitudinal, broad-based evaluation strategies are needed to do justice to this type of educational innovation, involving systematic research over a period of years within the schools and relevant community contexts ... Finding out what might happen within one school or one year is vital, but the most important effects of anti-racist policies may only be apparent over the very long term and in diffuse ways."* (Cumming & Mackay, 1994, p.8.)

In addition, because ARE is multi-faceted and touches many aspects of school life, it requires multiple measures and inevitably many human resources to co-ordinate and collect the information. Other limitations include the difficulties in isolating the direct relationships between ARE and outcomes such as student achievement and self-esteem. It would require controlling for many extraneous factors such as the effects of other school or Board initiatives or programs, the effects of home and the mass media, and the change in social-political climate during the study period, all of which may intervene and impact ARE in unpredictable ways. Hence, the reader should keep these limitations in mind in interpreting and drawing conclusions about this study.

Summary and discussion

This report describes the efforts made by a Family of schools to infuse an anti-racist education perspective into their school practices and assesses the extent to which their goals have been met within a period of four years.

The data indicate that the Toronto Board Wards 11/12 schools, collectively, have made a bold and ambitious attempt to tackle the issues of equity and diversity through their ARE plans which are comprehensive and cover many aspects of school life. They aimed beyond increasing the skills and knowledge of students in these issues to transforming their attitudes and behaviours. The ARE plans also tried to change the deep-rooted beliefs and practices of teachers in the ways they deliver their curriculum, choose their materials and treat their students of diverse backgrounds. Moreover, the ARE plans have attempted to make structural changes that require:

- rethinking and modifying existing school practices, guidelines and procedures (e.g., embedding the principles of equity into the classroom activities, the school's racial and ethnocultural harassment policy, and the selection and placement processes for the gifted programs);

- shifting the power relationships in the school (i.e., by recruiting more racial minority members to fill positions of authority, such as teachers and school administrators); and

- modifying the home-school relationships by inviting parents to be equal partners in the education of their children.

The schools have also recognized the importance of linking the issues of excellence with equity in their plans. They have attempted to remove barriers that block students from attaining equity in educational outcomes and to help children of all backgrounds to achieve well in school. Some examples include after-school reading programs, remedial programs, tutoring, mentoring, special resource materials and resource personnel (e.g., consultants) for children who need special attention.

The Wards 11/12 schools have achieved several goals with a fair degree of success. First, they have helped students to develop a pride in their own cultural backgrounds as well as respect and appreciation for other cultures. The achievement of the schools in these two areas is demonstrated in the declining number of racial incidents and the widespread inter-racial and inter-cultural friendships among the students.

Secondly, the schools have led their students to develop critical thinking skills in discerning different forms of injustice and to be assertive in resisting unfair beliefs and behaviours. Such accomplishments are evident in the teachers' descriptions of their curriculum content and examples of students' willingness to stand up against racist expressions within their school, family and immediate neighbourhood.

A third area of accomplishment is in the changing attitudes and behaviours of the school staffs. Except for a small portion of teachers who still resist the philosophy of ARE, most have embraced ARE and have become more attuned to the needs of their multi-racial, multi-ethnic student populations. Some teachers and principals even mentioned that, in addition to changing their attitudes and behaviours in school, ARE has had a spill-over effect into their family and personal lives.

Fourthly, it is no small feat for a Family of schools to garner the support of the majority of parents from diverse backgrounds for an initiative such as ARE. Although individual parents may have had slightly different expectations for ARE, the majority agreed that the curriculum content and materials have become more reflective of the diversity of the community, that the teachers treat their children equitably, that the interracial and intercultural relationships among students are working and that the school atmosphere has become more welcoming for parents to participate in their children's education.

Finally, in terms of the impact of ARE on student achievement, the present report provides a first glimpse by suggesting a link between the students' increased reading interest and the increase in inclusive materials. Other indirect measures such as a more equitable spread of school awards for students also suggest successes.

The study has also highlighted several areas that did not fully meet the expectations of the schools and require more attention in the future. First, principals and teachers commented with honesty about their feelings of frustration in bringing about the changes that they would like to see in areas such as the level of school involvement for minority parents, the number of racial minority teachers in the classrooms, and the acquisition of appropriate ARE materials for certain age groups, subject areas and cultural groups.

Secondly, the tracking data indicate that the gifted program enrolment pattern of students by race is not yet reflective of the student population, although some improvement has already been made in the underrepresentation of Black male students in the last few years.

Thirdly, a few minority parents still feel that some teachers inadvertently project lower expectations for children who are unfamiliar with the English language.

It is quite clear from the results that the majority of the stakeholders (principals, teachers, parents and students) see the need to continue with ARE in the future. This is a reasonable response in light of the many new manifestations of racism in society today (e.g., the advance in technology has allowed the spread of hate literature and racist messages on the Internet) and the amount of unfinished work that needs to be done. Since the public school system is one of the sites where people can work at dismantling racism and other forms of injustice, an on-going, "publicly stated and lived commitment" (Wright & Allingham, 1994, p.5.) of school staff to anti-racism is paramount. It is crucial, according to the majority of the stakeholders in this study, that our students continue to acquire the knowledge and skills to challenge discrimination and to develop leadership skills that equip them to become future advocates for social change.

Thus, it appears that the question with which the schools have to contend is not whether ARE should continue, but rather in what form it should continue. The work of Enid Lee (1991), who described the various forms of ARE, provides some ideas for future directions for this family of schools. According to Lee, the four stages of ARE are:

1. The surface stage which changes a few expressions of culture in the schools such as bringing in a variety of foods and festivals

2. The transitional stage which teaches other cultures as a unit of study which is separate from the main curriculum

3. The structural change stage which integrates elements of the multicultural unit into the existing curriculum and teaches students to think critically about equity issues

4. The social change stage which links the anti-racist curriculum with the outside world.

There is considerable evidence that the schools in Wards 11/12 have mostly moved beyond the first three stages of ARE described by Lee, and there are signs that these schools are ready to move on to the next stage in which the curriculum is used to change the community outside of school and to instill in students a sense of responsibility in changing society at large. Social action appears to be the next area that these schools might consider incorporating in their future ARE local plans. As Dei (1993) pointed out, it is important for ARE to be able "to raise the level of individual and group consciousness, to develop critical political thinking and links and to encourage activism among all teachers, staff, and students for meaningful change in society." (p. 38).

On the other hand, the fact that some teachers and parents still feel threatened by ARE has to be addressed. It is crucial that the curriculum be inclusive and maintain a balance between the mainstream and minority groups. This requires the schools to monitor their classroom and school activities and materials to ensure that they do not inadvertently exclude certain groups from the curriculum and thus strengthen fears of ARE. The true spirit of an inclusive curriculum is to enrich students' learning by "the emphasis on different histories, experiences and a variety of human perspectives" (Dei, 1993, p.41) Dei continued to explain that an inclusive curriculum is not meant "to replace one Eurocentric curriculum with another, [but] to ensure that diverse human experiences and knowledges are represented so that students can relate to the curriculum in different ways." (p.41).

In addition, schools have to convey to parents the message that ARE does not replace the teaching of academic skills, but rather reinforces it. In fact, many of the ARE implementation strategies described in this report are synonymous with approaches that bring about quality education and exemplify "sound educational principles which, when applied, will prepare all learners to live in the global village." (Newton, 1992, p.20).

Table 2: Survey of parents of Grades 3-8 students in Wards 11/12 schools, 1994-95

Support for anti-racist education (% of parents who said "yes")	Overall (N=213)	Asian (N=68)	Black (N=30)	White (N=76)
Do you support the idea of anti-racist education?	83%	91%	75%	80%
Is it important for your child to study in a school with an anti-racist learning environment?	83%	89%	76%	84%
Do you think there is a need to have anti-racist education in your child's school?	73%	83%	76%	64%
Curriculum content (% of parents who "strongly agree" or "agree")				
This school teaches my child to respect all cultures (besides the mainstream culture) in our society.	80%	82%	74%	84%
Racism in teaching materials is properly dealt with by staff in my child's school.	74%	79%	79%	75%
The school lessons and activities take into consideration the differences in students' backgrounds (such as language, culture and life experiences).	70%	71%	69%	73%
The things my child learns in school make him/her feel proud to be who he/she is.	69%	74%	80%	69%
The success of the schools in reflecting the racial/ethnic mix of the community in lessons, activities and materials (% of parents who said "very well" or "well")				
Pictures and displays on walls	75%	72%	72%	79%
Special events and celebrations	73%	72%	72%	80%
Book collection in the library	68%	76%	65%	66%
After school extracurricular activities	67%	72%	64%	70%
Lesson content (what is taught)	64%	73%	70%	56%
Teachers' treatment of students (% of parents who "strongly agree" or "agree")				
My child is encouraged by teachers in this school to learn to the best of her/his ability.	81%	85%	93%	82%
Teachers have high expectations for all students regardless of race and gender in this school.	78%	84%	76%	81%
My child is treated fairly by adults in school.	77%	83%	79%	76%
My child receives appropriate recognition for his/her achievements.	76%	79%	80%	75%

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Impact of AEE on students (% of parents who "strongly agree" or "agree")	Overall (N=215)	Asian (N=68)	Black (N=30)	White (N=76)
This school's anti-racist education program has helped my child to improve in his/her school achievement.	44%	70%	32%	28%
Anti-racist education has helped my child to feel better about his/her cultural/racial backgrounds.	50%	71%	54%	37%
School climate (% of parents who "strongly agree" or "agree")				
There is co-operation and respect among students of different ethnic/racial groups in this school.	67%	73%	70%	66%
Racial incidents are treated seriously by staff in my child's school.	74%	74%	76%	78%

Note:
The Grades 3-8 students (approximately 800) who were selected to fill out the student survey in 1995 were asked to bring home a parent survey form as well. Parents who received more than one form from different children were asked to fill out only one form. Survey forms in Chinese, Vietnamese, Portuguese and Spanish were available for families who needed them. The response rate was hard to estimate because it was not known how many students brought their forms home and how many parents received more than one form (because they have more than one child in the sample).

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Table 3: Survey of teachers in Wards 11/12 schools, 1991-92 and 1994-95

A: Teachers' attitudes towards and readiness to implement ARE (% of teachers who indicated "agree" or "strongly agree")	1991-92 (N=155)	1994-95 (N=71)
♦ support the philosophy of ARE	NA	90%
♦ treat anti-racist education as one of the top priorities in their teaching	NA	80%
♦ see a need to implement ARE in their school	NA	61%
♦ are well prepared to integrate anti-racist education into their teaching	61%	83%
♦ are well prepared to deal with incidents of overt racism between students (e.g., name-callings, fights)	74%	75%
♦ require a great deal of extra effort to implement ARE in their classroom	NA	18%
♦ require a great deal of extra time to integrate ARE into their curriculum	NA	16%
B: Integration of ARE into curriculum content and activities (% of teachers who indicated "often" or "very often"):		
♦ provide opportunities for cross-cultural and cross-racial interaction in work and play groups	93%	93%
♦ affirm or recognize the racial/ethnic backgrounds of all students in class	87%	90%
♦ provide opportunities for students from all racial groups to share their heritage and personal experiences in class	80%	83%
♦ instill in students a sense of responsibility in countering racism in their community	NA	76%
♦ talk about the contributions of peoples from a range of societies and cultures	NA	70%
♦ have classroom practices and activities that recognize both the dominant and minority cultures (e.g., celebration of holidays)	62%	68%
♦ help children recognize, understand and challenge racism and social inequities	58%	66%
♦ show racial minority persons in counter-stereotypical roles (e.g., in materials, as guest speakers, as resource people)	53%	54%
♦ provide opportunities to examine misconceptions about different groups	47%	52%
♦ organize social actions related to ARE (e.g., initiate a letter writing campaign to protest negative stereotyping in the media)	NA	16%
♦ use books and other curriculum materials that depict people from a range of societies and cultures	81%	86%

Notes:

1. Items marked with NA are those that appeared in the 1994-95 survey only.
2. The response rates for teachers for Years 1 and Years 4 were 78% and 36% respectively. Two principals implied in their interviews that the drop in teacher participation of the survey in Year 4 might be due partly to the overwhelming workloads of teachers because of the simultaneous implementation of several new major Board initiatives.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

C: Integration of ARE into teaching practices (% of teachers who indicated "often" or "very often")	1991-92 (N=155)	1994-95 (N=71)
♦ organize classroom seating and student groups in ways that will not marginalize students from any racial groups	93%	98%
♦ provide opportunities for students from all racial groups to take leadership roles in the class or in group work	98%	94%
♦ provide opportunities for students from all racial groups to perform jobs with added responsibility (e.g., reading to others)	96%	94%
♦ provide opportunities for students from all racial groups to be experts in different areas	78%	84%
D: Reflection of diversity in curriculum materials (% of teachers who indicated that the ethnic/racial mix of their students are "well" or "very well" reflected in:)		
♦ math and science displays and materials	40%	94%
♦ book collection	60%	79%
♦ pictures and materials on the wall	61%	69%
♦ art and music displays, musical instruments, etc.	43%	54%
♦ toys, games, props, supplies, etc.	29%	53%
E: Inservice needs of teachers (% of teachers who indicated that they "need in-service training" in:)		
♦ how to turn student awareness and knowledge about racism into social action	NA	54%
♦ practical suggestions on classroom techniques	54%	47%
♦ information on dealing with sensitive/awkard situations	54%	45%
♦ suggestions on integrating anti-racism into specific curriculum areas	55%	45%
♦ causes and patterns of racism in Canada and the world	NA	25%
♦ definition/concept of anti-racist education	NA	9%

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Table 4: Survey of Grades 3-8 students in Wards 11/12 schools, 1994-95

(% of students who said "yes")	Overall (N=625)	Asian (N=167)	Black (N=118)	White (N=253)	Latin American (N=42)
School climate:					
Do you like to be in a school with kids of different races (such as Whites, Blacks, Chinese)?	93%	93%	93%	93%	95%
Do kids with different skin colour often play together at your school?	88%	89%	85%	88%	95%
At your school, is it hard for kids who don't speak English well to make friends with kids who speak English well?	38%	34%	34%	39%	38%
Do you feel that you fit in at school?	83%	86%	85%	83%	78%
Racial incidents:					
Did someone at school call you by a racist name this year?	25%	24%	27%	23%	24%
If someone at school called you by a racist name this year, did you always tell your teacher or principal about it?	35%	24%	29%	39%	33%
Did you call someone in your school by a racist name this year?	8%	5%	11%	8%	5%
Do you think that calling racist names is a bad thing?	95%	94%	96%	95%	95%
Does it hurt a lot to be called by a racist name?	77%	75%	83%	76%	78%
Do kids at your school sometimes push, hit or throw things at other kids because they are from a different race?	23%	23%	23%	24%	21%
Is the principal (or vice-principal) serious about racist name calling?	81%	80%	84%	81%	85%
Are teachers at your school serious about racist name calling?	78%	82%	78%	75%	80%
Are your parents or adults you live with serious about racist name calling?	71%	57%	79%	74%	80%

Notes:
1. The 45 students who made up the group from "other" races, or provided no race information were not included in this table.
2. About 30% of the grades 3-8 students in Wards 11/12 schools received a questionnaire, and 83% of them responded.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

(% students who said "yes") (con't)	Overall (N=625)	Asian (N=167)	Black (N=118)	White (N=253)	Latin American (N=42)
Curriculum content:					
Do some of the things you learn in school make people from some races look bad?	15%	13%	15%	15%	10%
In school, do you learn about the countries that different kids in your school come from?	81%	84%	84%	79%	76%
Do the things you learn in school make you feel proud to be who you are?	73%	77%	73%	70%	69%
In school, do your teachers or other adults talk about the holidays your family celebrates at home?	71%	72%	73%	72%	64%
In class, do your teachers talk about what racism means?	68%	71%	65%	73%	58%
Curriculum materials:					
In the books that you read at school, are there stories and pictures of people like you and your family?	51%	49%	49%	52%	55%
Do you like the way your school books talk about people like you and your family?	46%	41%	47%	50%	45%
Teachers' expectations and treatment:					
Do you get as many chances as other kids to do special jobs for your teacher in class?	63%	71%	63%	59%	55%
Do you think you are treated fairly by adults in your school?	58%	64%	50%	58%	51%
Students' feelings about self:					
Are you happy being who you are?	92%	91%	92%	92%	98%
Are you happy with the way you look?	86%	85%	91%	86%	85%
Do you think you can do as well as other kids in school if you want to?	86%	84%	88%	87%	93%

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Table 5: Survey of Grades 3-8 students in Wards 11/12 schools, 1991-92

(% of students who said "yes")	Overall (N=1169)	Asian (N=290)	Black (N=204)	White (N=477)	Latin American (N=68)
School climate:					
Is it fun to be in a school with children who are from many different races such as White, Black, Chinese, Indian?	90%	89%	90%	91%	93%
Do kids with different skin colour often play together at your school?	84%	83%	83%	83%	92%
Is it hard for children who don't speak English well to make friends at your school?	35%	37%	37%	33%	34%
Do you feel that you fit in at school?	77%	77%	77%	78%	73%
Racial incidents:					
Did someone at school call you by a racist name this year?	40%	50%	45%	29%	42%
Do you think that calling racist names is a bad thing?	93%	93%	92%	93%	97%
Does it hurt a lot to be called by a racist name?	86%	88%	87%	83%	92%
Do kids at your school sometimes push, hit or throw things at other kids because they are from a different race?	28%	32%	32%	22%	40%
Does the principal (or vice-principal) take racist name calling seriously?	71%	67%	76%	70%	76%
Do you think the teachers at your school take racist name calling seriously?	78%	78%	78%	79%	80%
Curriculum content:					
Do you learn about the countries that different children in your school come from?	77%	79%	81%	73%	80%
In class, do you learn about people who look different from you?	74%	76%	78%	72%	70%
In school, do you hear about the holidays your family celebrates at home?	71%	71%	71%	73%	68%
Do you sometimes talk about racism at school?	74%	73%	74%	76%	63%

Notes:
1. The 134 students who made up the group from "other" races, or provided no race information were not included in this table.
2. About half of the grades 3-8 students in Wards 11/12 schools received a questionnaire, and 93% of them responded.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

(% of students who said "yes") (con't)	Overall (N=1140)	Asian (N=29)	Black (N=204)	White (N=477)	Latin American (N=64)
Curriculum materials:					
In the books you read at school, are there people like you and your family?	48%	50%	47%	46%	47%
Do some books that you read in school make people from some races look bad?	31%	27%	29%	34%	35%
Teachers' expectations and treatment:					
Do you get as many chances as other kids to do special jobs for your teacher in class?	68%	71%	70%	68%	66%
Are children from all races and ethnic groups treated equally at your school?	53%	55%	55%	51%	62%
Students' feelings about self:					
Are you happy being who you are?	94%	91%	96%	95%	92%
Are you happy with the way you look?	88%	82%	93%	88%	87%

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Table 6: Racial composition of administrative staff in Wards 11/12 schools

	1990-1991			1994-1995		
Racial Composition	**Principal**	**Vice Principal**	**Total**	**Principal**	**Vice Principal**	**Total**
White	12 (100%)	8 (80%)	20 (91%)	10 (83%)	7 (78%)	17 (81%)
Racial Minority	0 (0%)	2 (20%)	2 (9%)	2 (17%)	2 (22%)	4 (19%)
TOTAL	12 (100%)	10 (100%)	22 (100%)	12 (100%)	9 (100%)	21 (100%)

Appendix 1

Data Collection Methods for the Anti-Racist Education Project in Wards 11/12

WHAT TO COLLECT	HOW TO COLLECT	WHO TO COLLECT	WHEN TO COLLECT
Occurrence of racial incidents in the school.	Each school keeps a record of the number of racial incidents, how they are handled and what efforts are made to turn the incidents into learning experiences.	Individual Principals/VPs from all schools.	On-going throughout the school year. A semi-annual summary is submitted to Research.
Enrolment patterns of students in gifted programs, e.g., school enrichment programs, Saturday morning programs.	Teachers from the gifted programs provide a head count of the number of students, broken down by race.	Gifted program teachers who have students from Wards 11/12.	November/December of each school year.
Distribution patterns of school awards given to students.	Each school keeps a record of the number and types of awards given to students broken down by race and gender.	Individual principals/VPs from all schools.	On-going throughout the school year. A year-end summary is submitted to Research.
Program placement patterns of students in secondary school.	Extract secondary school program placement data by race from the 1991(G9-OAC) and 1996 (G10-OAC) Every Secondary Student Surveys for all feeder schools in Wards 11 & 12.	Research Department.	When the data for the 1991-92 and 1996-97 are ready for this type of special analysis.
Number and nature of parent-teacher contacts.	a) Documentation of contacts between principals/vice-principals and parents of different racial groups.	Logs kept by individual Principals/VPs from all schools.	A block of time in each Fall and Spring term in Years 1, 2 and 4..
	b) Documentation of contacts between teachers and parents of different racial groups.	Logs kept by a sample of teachers from Pr., Jr. & Sr. Grades from two schools in each Ward.	A block of time in each Fall and Spring term in Years 1, 2 and 4.
Ethnic-racial relationships among students.	a) Observation by homeroom teachers on who the students interact with in the playground and the types of interactions.	Samples of homeroom teachers from two schools in each ward, one class each from Pr., Jr., & Sr. Grades.	1991-92.
	b) Content analyses on students' writing samples on their knowledge and attitudes about racial incidents.	Research Department.	1991-92.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

WHAT TO COLLECT	HOW TO COLLECT	WHO TO COLLECT	WHEN TO COLLECT
Overall change and impact of the intervention program.	a) Focus group interviews of samples of classroom teachers, students and parents from all 13 schools.	Research Department.	Year One and Year Four.
	b) Individual interviews with a sample of teacher librarians.	Research Department.	Year One and Year Four.
	c) Individual interviews with all school principals.	Research Department.	Year One and Year Four.
	d) An individual interview with the School-Superintendent	Research Department.	Year Four.
	e) Surveys of students, teachers and parents.	Research Department.	Year One and Year Four for student & teacher surveys. The parent survey was conducted only at Year Four.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Reference List

Bray, R. (1990). "Self-esteem: Hoax or reality?" New York Times, November 4, 1990, p.33.

Cheng, M. & Soudack, A. (1992a). Wards 11/12 family of schools anti-racist education project: A summary of the 1991-92 Local School Plans for implementing anti-racist education in Wards 11 and 12. Interim report. Toronto Board of Education, Research Services.

Cheng, M. & Soudack, A. (1992b). Wards 11/12 family of schools anti-racist education project: A summary of curriculum changes and classroom practices for implementing ARE. Interim report. Toronto Board of Education, Research Services.

Cheng, M. & Soudack, A. (1992c). Wards 11/12 Family of schools anti-racist education project: Interview with librarians on anti-racist education. Interim report. Toronto Board of Education, Research Services.

Cheng, M. & Soudack, A. (1993). Wards 11/12 family of schools anti-racist education project: Attitudes of principals, teachers and parents about anti-racist education. Interim report. Toronto Board of Education, Research Services.

Cheng, M., Yau, M. & Ziegler, S. (1993) The 1991 Every Secondary Student Survey, Part II: Detailed profiles of Toronto's secondary school students. Toronto Board of Education, Research Services. Report # 204.

Cheng, M. (1996a). Wards 11/12 family of schools anti-racist education project: Tracking of gifted program enrolment between 1991-92 and 1994-95. Toronto Board of Education, Research and Assessment Department.

Cheng, M. (1996b). Wards 11/12 family of schools anti-racist education project: Tracking of school awards between 1991-92 and 1994-95. Toronto Board of Education, Research and Assessment Department.

Cheng, M. (1996c). Wards 11/12 family of schools anti-racist education project: Tracking of racial incidents between 1991-92 and 1994-95. Toronto Board of Education, Research and Assessment Department.

Cheng, M. (1996d). Wards 11/12 family of schools anti-racist education project: Tracking of parental involvement between 1991-92 and 1994-95. Toronto Board of Education, Research and Assessment Department.

Corson, D. (1994). "Anti-bias practices for ESL teachers." Orbit, 25 (2), pp. 9-11.

Cumming, A. & MacKay, R. (1994). "Evaluating school policy for anti-racist education." Orbit, 25 (2), pp. 6-8.

Dei, G. (1993). "The challenge of anti-racist education in Canada." Canadian Ethnic Studies, 25 (2), pp.36-51.

James, C. (1994). "I don't want to talk about it." Orbit, 25 (2), pp. 26-29.

Lee, E. (1991). "Taking multicultural, anti-racist education seriously." Rethinking Schools, October-November, 6 (1), pp. 1-4.

Newton, C. (1992). "Issues in antiracism education." Education Forum, 18 (2), p. 20b.

Reed, C. A. (1994). "The anti-racist dimensions of Holocaust education." Orbit, 25 (2), pp. 15-17.

Toronto Board of Education. (1979). The final report of sub-committee on race-relations.

Toronto Board of Education. (1984). Race relations program, phase II.

Toronto Board of Education. (1990). Curriculum Implementation Priorities (1990-92).

Willis, S. (1990). "Feeling good and doing well: Experts debate role of self-esteem in the curriculum." ASCD Update, March, p.6

Wright, O. & Allingham, N. (1994). "The policy and practice of anti-racist education." Orbit, 25 (2), pp. 4-6.